MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : If it is allowed, the discussion of the motion will take place only at 3-30 P. M. Therefore in the meanwhile the House will be in a position to gather information.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : As two adjournment motions have been presented both of them have to be ruled out under the Rules.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*) : I press it, Sir.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): As the Rules do not allow any discretion in allowing the motions it is better for the President to disallow both.

PRESIDENT: The Rules are not very clear on that subject and present a great deal of difficulty. Therefore I must exercise my discretion in the best way I think possible in the interests of the House. I put it to Mr. Piraviperumal Pillai whether he wants to pursue his point and if he does so to permit him to do so to the exhaustion of the time intented for resolutions, I personally have the least objection.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*) : We will take the sense of the House.

MR. C. P. TARAKAN (*Kunnatnad*) : I object to the leave being granted.

PRESIDENT: This is the statement—the unsigned one, I presume, of Mr. Piraviperumal Pillai to discuss the apathetic attitude of the P. W. D. in not looking to the proper condition of the bridges which has resulted in the sudden giving way of Killipalam.

Objection having been taken for leave being granted to your motion, I must ask the members who are for the motion to rise up in their place. (*Five members rose in their places*).

As there are not 20 members in support of the motion, the motion cannot be made.

Resolutions on matters of General Public interest.

PRESIDENT : Now we come to resolutions and the first one stands in the name of Mr. M. N. Pillai, and it runs as follows :—

"This Council recommends to the Government that they be pleased to encourage Homeopathy by a liberal system of grants-in-aid to duly qualified practitioners of the system in Travancore and by opening Homeopathic dispensaries and hospitals in places where there is a great demand for them".

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*) : Sir, I beg to move the following resolution :—

"*This Council recommends to the Government that they be pleased to encourage Homeopathy by a liberal system of grants-in-aid to duly qualified practitioners of the system in Travancore and by opening Homeopathic dispensaries and hospitals in places where there is a great demand for them,*"

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. M. N. Pillai.]

I may be permitted to mention at the very outset that I am moving the resolution with a great deal of confidence. This confidence is the result of the intrinsic merits of the subject and my appreciation of the robust good sense of this House when the vital problem of public health is placed before them for discussion. I am only sorry that so late in the day when Travancore has fallen into line with the other civilised countries of the world in their ideas of things, one is constrained to stand up in his place in this Council and address you on the virtues of Homeopathy—virtues which are so well-known to all. Sir, there is nothing which is so difficult to be dislodged from its pedestal as the sway of erroneous ideas and particularly so when ignorance is supported by the conservative prejudice of centuries of tradition. I am therefore unable to understand the mentality of some of the followers of other systems of medical treatment when they say that Homeopathy is an unscientific system. However it becomes necessary for me to explain the scientific basis of Homeopathy for the benefit of such ill-informed critics.

Homeopathy is a thoroughly scientific system of treatment based on a law of nature that "like cures like" as expressed by the motto *Similia, Similibus Curantur*. Careful and extensive experiments have proved that this is a safe, sure, quick and scientific method of using drugs in the treatment of diseases. Every drug in the Homeopathic Pharmacopœia is thoroughly proved on the healthy human subject before its use, in the treatment of diseases. It was Dr. Samuel Hahnemann of Germany that found out, that by giving a large dose of a particular medicine to a healthy man symptoms of artificial diseases are produced, and this the action of the drugs on the human system has been carefully observed and faithfully recorded. In curing a disease of similar description in a patient, an infinitesimal dose of the same drug is given and a rapid, gentle and permanent cure is effected. For example when a healthy man takes a large dose of arsenic, symptoms similar to those of cholera are developed. In the treatment of an actual case of cholera, when there are symptoms resembling arsenic poisoning a dose of arsenic, a billionth part or even less quantity of a grain, is administered and a cure is effected. Similarly quinine, belladona, mercury, sulphur, serpant poisons and all other drugs are proved on healthy human beings, before its administration to the sick. Thus we are enabled to give a single drug in very very minute dose in the treatment of diseases. By reducing the strength of the original drug, by diluting it with alcohol or some other liquid several times by a process known as potentization the poisonous effect of even the deadliest poison known is eliminated and the curative power of the drug is developed. For a Homeopath there is no difficulty to select a drug for any disease as our pharmacopœia comprises a very large number of medicines.

The Law of *Similia, Similibus Curantur* is as old as the Hindu system of medicine. Even at the time of Hippocrates, the founder of Allopathic treatment, this law was in vogue. But it was Dr. Samuel Hahnemann of Germany who developed this law of cure and brought it to perfection. By his experiments he found out the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

bark of cinchona has the power of producing symptoms similar to malarial fever in the healthy person and hence it is curative in malaria. It was in 1796 he first demonstrated the result of his researches and laid the foundations of Homeopathy. Dr. Hahnemann established by numerous experiments that the symptoms manifested by diseases are the efforts of nature to throw out the poisons from the system and the duty of the physician is simply to help nature in giving appropriate medicines in small doses so that the medicine should act and set right only the diseased parts and not disturb the healthy organs.

According to Homeopathic principle a medicine can be curative only when its diseases producing powers are such that their administration produces symptoms which are precisely similar to the symptoms shown by individual patients. Since the symptoms of the patients and the symptoms which the drugs are capable of causing are of similar nature, the patient will be sensitive to the action of the smallest dose of Homeopathic drug. If therefore a strong dose of medicine is given the symptoms will be increased and the patient will become worse instead of getting better. Even though Homeopathic doses are very minute they are very powerful and effect a rapid and safe cure. They are free from all manner of poison and therefore an over-dose will never do any harm even to a baby. Even Naturopaths who are against drugging in the cure of the sick support Homeopathy on the ground that this system is more akin to nature than any other.

It controls the disease whether acute or chronic, prevents the disease from complication and the bad effect of poisonous drugs. There is no tendency for drug habits and all curable diseases can be cured by Homeopathic drugs. The small Homeopathic dose goes right to the spot where it is needed and by mild and harmless stimulation of the affected parts assists and supports the cells in their eliminative effects. Homeopathic medication therefore is not only curative in its effects but also conservative and in the highest degree economic.

The law of *Similia* on which the science of Homeopathy is built was true then, is true to-day and it will be true for ever. It is an immutable law of nature. The Homeopathic law vindicates itself at the bedside and therefore is its own best evidence. Homeopathy has nothing to fear from any advances in scientific discovery which has a remote bearing on therapeutics for all such discoveries, will be such as to confirm the truth of *Similia, Similibus Curantur* enunciated by Dr. Hahnemann. Various investigators who had no connection with Homeopathy, whose views would have been altogether in an opposite direction, have substantiated more or less the law of therapeutics which Hahnemann has formulated and within the last few years the confirmations have been coming in more and more abundantly. Hahnemann as a philosopher and practitioner was generations in advance of his day and he broached theories which the state of science of his time gave him no means of proving. All these stand more than proved to-day.

During the epidemics of Cholera or small-pox Homeopathy cures more patients with their infinitesimal dose than any other known

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. M. N. Pillai.]

system of treatment. In 1854 the British Government appointed Dr. Macloughlin to report as to the treatment of cholera in the London Homeopathic Hospital and as a result of his investigation Parliamentary Return dated May 21, 1855 entitled "Cholera" testified that by the Homeopathic treatment the death rate was 16·4 per cent. while according to the aggregate statistics of allopathic Hospital it was 59·2 per cent. Dr. Macloughlin says "Although an allopath by principle, education and practice, yet was it the will of God to afflict me with cholera. I would rather be in the hands of a Homeopathic than an Allopathic adviser."

In the successful combating of typhoid fever, pneumonia and other acute diseases Homeopathy is surely not behind any other system. In severe forms of diseases pain and discomfort become markedly less, recovery becomes quicker when the patient is treated by Homeopathic Doctors. Some people think that it is only good in the treatment of children's diseases. But this is due to their ignorance. It is a fact that people take to Homeopathy in diseases of children more frequently than the adults, because the medicines are harmless sweet, or at least tasteless and there is no trouble in administering the medicines; and the percentage of recovery is much greater in this class of cases even from the most dangerous diseases. In Trivandrum I doubt if there are many houses where Homeopathy has not done good both in children and in adults.

In diseases of women Homeopathy is equally good and has even averted the necessity of serious operations by direct administration of medicines and has cured very complicated diseases peculiar to them. For the matter of that Homeopathic medicines have rendered surgical operations unnecessary in many cases. In the diseases of the mind and in all sorts of chronic cases it can do wonders. I know cases in which people who lost their power of speech for over two years have been completely cured by Homeo drugs. I can quote several instances when Homeopathy was successful where other systems of treatment had failed. I do not want to take much of the time of the Council by quoting several instances like this.

What I want to impress upon this House is that Homeopathy is never behind any other system of treatment and I dare say that most of my friends here will be able to testify to the efficiency of Homeopathic treatment.

To show the scientific correctness of the Law of "*Similia, Similibus Curantur*" I shall quote the recently advocated treatment of Bacterial diseases such as blood-poisoning, rheumatism, tuberculosis etc., with vaccines (which are solutions of dead bacterias or their toxins) is nothing more than a modified form of Homeopathy which originated with and has been in use among Homeopaths for the past sixty or seventy years, long before Allopathic system has adopted this. We were administering the disease poisons of some diseases in Homeopathic doses for similar diseases as curative agents and produced wonderful results long before Allopathy introduced them.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Sir, there are hundreds of qualified Allopathic Doctors who have become converts to this system and practise Homeopathy in almost all the civilized countries of the world. It is only a question of time that Homeopathy will be generally accepted by all. I shall quote the opinion of a few leading scientists about Homeopathy.

Among the latest converts to Homeopathy is that distinguished scientist and Privy Councillor, Dr. August Bier at Berlin whose name is familiar to every doctor because of the important discoveries he has made. Quite recently he startled Medical Germany by a long important address in the course of which he proclaimed his faith in Homeopathy in the following words "I shared with the old school, the opinion that Homeopathy was unscientific, humbug, unfit to occupy the attention of a regular physician. My real initiation into Homeopathy did not take place until 1920 when I began to study it at its fountain head, when I learned to separate the wheat from the chaff and rewarded by a harvest of wheat great enough to compensate me for my considerable labours. It became clear to me that, had I started these studies thirty years earlier I would have been spared a great many errors and detours." Dr. Bier is one of the greatest of the living surgeons and he treats his patients Homeopathically in his hospital.

Dr. Sir William Osler the greatest authority in medicine and Professor of Oxford University says thus: "It is not as if our Homeopathic brethren were asleep, far from it. They are awake to the importance of scientific study of diseases. The original grievous mistake was ours. To quarrel with our brothers over infinitesimals was a most unwise and stupid thing to do." Dr. Osler has said again on another occasion "No regular physician would ever admit that the Homeopathic preparations infinitesimals could do any good as direct curative agents and yet it was perfectly certain that Homeopaths lost no more of theirs than others." In typhoid Dr. Osler says "Homeopaths have, as a matter of fact, lost fewer patients than Allopaths." The great scientist Sir J. C. Bose, the great Poet Sir Rahindranath Tagore and the great Indian leader the late Mr. C. R. Das, the Maharaja of Kolhapur and many other Maharajas and other great personages are ardent supporters of Homeopathy in India.

The recent researches made by our distinguished scientist Sir Jagatish Chandra Bose on Plant Biology have shed a fresh light on the basic ideas of Homeopathy. The evidence gathered by Dr. Bose from his experiments on plants which consisted in treating different batches of them simultaneously with a dose of poison but in different degrees of dilution support the claims of Homeopathy. From the conclusions drawn by him as a result of his experiments it is seen that a poisonous agent which causes depression or death in a large dose acts but as a strong stimulant when administered in minute quantities.

In the last January number of *Science Progress*, edited by Sir Ronald Ross, the great scientist of England, Sir Oliver Lodge, says of Homeopathy thus: "It is clear that the followers of those who discovered the important principle of *Similia, Similibus Curantur* which

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. M. N. Pillai.]

lies at the basis of *serum therapy* and many other things and who have likewise emphasised the stimulating influence of minute doses sufficient to excite a curative effect but insufficient to cause damage are likely to be among the first to realise and apply to the human body discoveries about the nature of matter and its relation to the ether of space. For this, after all, though as yet incompletely developed may be regarded as the main discovery of the present era." I can quote the opinions of several other scientists in support of Homeopathy.

Though Homeopathy has come into existence only about 130 years ago it has spread throughout the civilized world. In most of the European countries Homeopathy has been recognised as an authorised system of medicine and enactments have been made by States to legalise its practice. The number of qualified Allopaths who take to the practice of Homeopathy is ever on the increase.

In the United States of America there are three Homeopathic foundations for researches in Homeopathy in New York, in Washington and in California. The progress of the system is rapid in America, where rich and poor alike take to Homeopathic treatment.

The following well-known figures of America are treated, when sick, by Homeopathic physicians and some give leberally to Homeopathic institutions. Messrs. John D. Rockfeller-Senior; Rockfeller-Junior; P. B. Mellon of the Mellon Bank; A. W. Waterman, President Waterman Fountain Pen Company; Charles Kettering of General Motor Co., Rodman Wanamaker of Wanamaker Stores; William Wrighly of Chewing Gum fame and several other well known millionaires.

Every State in the United States has got a Homeopathic Hospital and almost every University has got a Homeopathic College. In Philadelphia, a Homeopathic Hospital and a Medical College is now under construction, a 20-storied modern building, to accommodate 736 patients and 750 students, and the people raised easily two million Dollers or about Rs. 65 lakhs by voluntary subscription. In England the following well-known persons are the patrons of Homeopathy.

H. R. H. the Prince of Wales; H. R. H. the Duke of York; Eral of Donoughmore; Earl of Dystart; Countess of Clan William; Eral of Plymouth; The Dowager Countess of Plymouth; Lord Clanmorris; Countess of Lincriek; Lord Stannore; Earl of Winchelsea; Lord Stanley; Sir Oliver Lodge; Sir George Wyatt Trascott, Ex-Lord Mayor of London; Sir Rowland Blades, Lord Mayor of London; Mr. Gorden Selfridge and several other prominent figures. Doctor John Wier, C. V. O. a Homeopath is the present physician to H. R. H. the Prince of Wales.

In India, particularly in Bengal, there are a very large number of doctors practising the system. Many of the Municipalities have their own Homeopathic Dispensaries and the Madras Corporation gives a grant to Hahnemann Free Homeopathic Dispensary in Madras. The State of Kolhapur has got a Homeopathic Medical Department and so

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

also some of the other Native States in Upper India. It was the late Dr. Mohendra Lal Sircar, M. D. C. I. E., who was a member of the old Imperial Legislative Council who first introduced it in India and ever since it is growing rapidly in every town and village of India.

In Travancore the progress of Homeopathy is remarkably rapid. Most of the members of this House have had occasions to get the benefit of this system of treatment and know its beneficial effects. I was the first to go to Calcutta from Travancore to study Homeopathy and set up practice about 20 years ago. In my early days of practice, to most of the people of Trivandrum, the name of Homeopathy itself was new and the people were sceptical about its efficacy. Now as a matter of fact a large number of people are practising the system even in the remotest villages of Travancore. I know many of the native physicians owe some measure of their success to Homeopathic drugs. I know some of the Allopathic Doctors in and out of the service practice Homeopathy.

Homeopathy is becoming popular day by day among the rich and poor, the learned and the ignorant alike, and there is a growing demand for Homeopaths in the country.

It is the most harmless but most effective system of treatment based on scientific principles and in accordance with the law of nature.

It is a very effective system of treatment in the diseases of children, in the infectious and contageous diseases, and in most serious, acute or chronic diseases.

It is most suited to our poor country because it is very cheap when compared to any other system of treatment.

If Homeopathic Hospitals and Dispensaries be established by the Government the cost of the medicines can be cut short by a considerable amount.

Homeopathy is not only useful in the treatment of human beings, but it is equally effective in the treatment of animals and it is adopted in the Veterinary Departments of the European countries.

The Travancore Government are spending lakhs and lakhs of rupees for Medical relief by the Allopathic and Ayurvedic systems. When there is a growing demand from the people for the establishment of Homeopathic Dispensaries and Hospitals it is only just that the Government should give every encouragement to the Homeopathic system of treatment also. At the outset Government may start a dispensary and a small hospital with provision for a few dozen inpatients in this town, and watch the progress of the institution before its introduction into the mofussil stations. I hope the Medical Board composed of members who are above petty prejudice will accept the suggestion I put to them whether it would be proper to oppose this suggestion when the Government are giving the benefits of their support to systems other than Allopathy such as Ayurvedic and Unani systems

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

of treatment. I do not in any manner detract from the usefulness of other systems. They are useful as Allopathy. As a humble votary of Homeopathy it is my privilege to maintain that Homeopathy is as good as, if not better than, any other systems of medical treatment. Sir, I trust all fairminded people will acknowledge the force of this plea. I am glad to be able to say that even in this town the capital of the State, men and women of very high position, high officers, eminent lawyers, rich merchants and other people of discernment are having recourse to Homeopathic treatment. I take it to be a slur on the cultivated intelligence of this capital city and of this enlightened country if any one, be he Doctor or layman, comes forward to oppose the justice of my demand. Sir, most of the misunderstandings of the world are the result of ignorance. A desire to maintain oneself in the citadel of ignorance is of all sins the most sinful, and it is a sin to the poor people of the country, a sin to humanity. I do not advocate a system which is based on mere arguments or in the statements of quacks or montebanks. I base my claim on the experience of the most eminent scientists of the day. Homeopathy has gained ground throughout the civilised world, and I assure you Sir, that it is making rapid strides in Travancore where a steady policy of public instruction has made the generality of the people, excellent judges of what is good and what is bad. I feel sure, Sir, that the Government will not accept the ready-made opinion of those who are nurtured in other systems of medical treatment and are therefore not alive to the benefits of the system whose claim I am putting forward before this august and discerning assembly for their kind acceptance. With these words I commend the resolution to this House.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : May I know whether he knows any expert Homeopathic Doctor in Trivandrum ?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*) : Yes, there are;

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : Can he number one ; the most eminent man ?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*) : He can very easily find out on making enquiries.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : If he has no objection he can mention the name of the Doctor. I want only the most eminent.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*) ; I am unwilling to answer this question.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : May I know whether he holds the same opinion in regard to the Chinthamani treatment?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*) : I do not know much about the Chinthamani treatment. Perhaps the member knows better. After I learn that system I shall be able to give you my opinion on that system of treatment.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil cum Devicolam*) : Is he aware of the percentage of cases cured in any of the dispensaries in Trivandrum ?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): How to compare unless there are, side by side, Government institutions in Allopathy and Homeopathy.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Can he give the number of cases treated and the cures effected in the course of the last one or two years in any of the dispensaries in Trivandrum or out of Trivandrum?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): 90 per cent of my cases are successful.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know what is the suggestion implied in the comparison that he made with reference to the figures of cholera cases in London?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Homeopathy is superior.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Does he mean to say that the Allopathic treatment should be done away with?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Perhaps in this particular treatment Homeopathy is superior to other systems. I do not mean to say that Homeopathy alone is superior in all cases of treatment.

MR. KURANDIPALLIL R. RAMAN PILLAI (*Quilon*): What is his opinion in regard to the treatment by Bio-chemistry?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): That is a branch of Homeopathy

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Has any of the Indian Universities recognised this system by any examination?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): No.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): How are we to ascertain whether a man is qualified or not?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): There is a College at Calcutta in which there is a course of instruction for three years.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Are there recognised institutions?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): It is recognised by the American Universities.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Not by the Indian Government?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Under the Indian Government there is no College for Homeopathy.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Is it necessary to undergo a course of study in the College?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Yes, if you want to practise successfully, You can also have a private study practice.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Has any one passed the examination by private study?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): There are many compounders of the allopathic system of treatment who have passed the examination by private study and got their diplomas from correspondence schools.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): So far as the determination of the qualification is concerned does he say that the Calcutta qualification is the best?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Or it may be better to go to America where there is a University course.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Will he be satisfied if special encouragement is given to persons qualified in America alone?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Those who were once Allopaths and now practise Homeopathy, if they take to Homeopathy seriously, they are sufficiently qualified.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Whom does he recognise as competent to give the qualification?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): There is the College authority in Calcutta. Again, there are now several correspondence courses of study. Anybody can get a M. D., or M. B., by correspondence course. Because there is no legislation as regards Homeopathy, so every body takes to that easy method. But only those who study in Calcutta, that is for 3 years, will be able to treat patients successfully under this system.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): So this system is so harmless that anybody can practise it?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Anybody can practise and there are several lay men using it in their own homes and unless there is a serious case they never consult a doctor.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Can a private man purchase the degree of M. D. or M. B.?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Of course he can if he has sufficient money to purchase it.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): May I know whether M. D. degrees are purchased?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Yes, they are purchased. Even the Allopathic degrees can be purchased?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): If it is so popular will it not be self-supporting?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Of course, it is self-supporting. It is not for personal gain that I am advocating it. I do not stand in need of any encouragement.

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): I do not mean that. If the system had been able to make such a headway during the last two years will it not become in course of time self-supporting?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Unless there is sufficient encouragement it cannot sufficiently advance.

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): People are, you say, encouraging it; it is to the people that you go with the medical aid.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): So also it must be in the case of Allopathy. Supposing in the hospitals they do not get medicine free, they should charge every patient for medicine. What I say is, you may devote a portion of the money spent for the allopathic system of treatment for those who desire to be benefited by the Homeopathic system.

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Am I to understand that he only wants to abolish State-aid to all medical institutions?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): No, I do not want that. As long as the Government are good enough to supply medical aid freely, I would gladly support it.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): Is this to increase the medical aid?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Yes, for instance there are not many hospitals even in the town of Trivandrum. There are many places far away in the mofussil just outside the town where people are in need of medical aid. So also in villages. I shall quote a speech recently delivered by Mr. Arogyaswami Mudaliyar who was the Health Minister when he presided over the anniversary of the Hahnemann's Dispensary. He said "Of the value of the Homeopathic system of treatment, I cannot presume to talk with very much authority. But there is one thing that appeals to me very much. We are all aware that the present Allopathic system of medical treatment is reaching after all a very small portion of the total population of this Presidency. And all those whose task it is to look to a solution of this problem of bringing medical relief to the rural parts must welcome all the agencies that give help to them in solving this problem."

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Is it not clear that Mr. Arogyaswami Mudaliar was speaking about the need for extending medical aid? He was not comparing Homeopathy with Allopathy.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): He is no authority on the subject. He was only speaking of the extension of medical treatment to rural parts through whatever agency. Yesterday was the anniversary of Dr. Hahnemann's Dispensary at Madras. I had an invitation to attend. Surgeon General Major Hutchinson presided over the anniversary. In tomorrow's papers you will probably see the speeches. Had he been against Homeopathy he would not have presided over the function.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Thodupuzha*): ഞാൻ പ്രമേയത്തെഅനുകൂലമായി പിൻ താങ്ങുന്നു. മരുന്നുകഴിക്കുവാൻ അരുചി ഇല്ലാത്തതുകൊണ്ടും, വലിയപഥ്യം ആചരിക്കേണ്ട ആവശ്യമില്ലാത്തതു കൊണ്ടും, ഔഷധങ്ങളുടെ വില വളരെ കുറവായതുകൊണ്ടും, ശസ്ത്രക്രിയ ഇല്ലാത്തതിനാൽ രോഗികൾക്കു വലിയവേദനസഹിക്കേണ്ട ആവശ്യമില്ലാത്തതുകൊണ്ടും, ഹോമിയോപ്പതി ചികിത്സാസമ്പ്രദായം ജനങ്ങൾക്കു വളരെഗുണകരമായ ഒന്നാണ്. ഇതിനെപണ്ടേതന്നെ ഗവർമെൻറ് പ്രോത്സാഹിപ്പിക്കേണ്ടതായിരുന്നു.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): മി: കുഞ്ഞുത്തൊമ്മൻ ഈ ചികിത്സനടത്തുന്നുണ്ടോ?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): ഉണ്ട്. എന്റെ കയ്യിൽ ഇപ്പോഴും തന്നെ അനേകം മരുന്നുകളുണ്ട്.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): രോഗികളെ ചികിത്സിക്കാറുണ്ടോ?

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): ആവശ്യംപോലെയെല്ലാം കൊടുക്കുന്നുണ്ട്.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): സ്നേഹിതന്മാർക്കു കൊടുക്കാറുണ്ടോ?.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): സ്നേഹിതന്മാർക്കും ശത്രുക്കൾക്കും ഒക്കെ കൊടുക്കാറുണ്ട് (ചിരി).

ഇപ്പോൾ അലോപ്പതി വൈദ്യസമ്പ്രദായത്തിനു ഗവർണ്മെൻറിൽ നിന്നു വളരെ ധനവ്യയം ചെയ്യുന്നുണ്ട്. എന്നാൽ അലോപ്പതി ചികിത്സ കൊണ്ട്, ഞാൻ ഇവിടെ പലപ്പോഴും പ്രസ്താവിച്ചിട്ടുള്ളതുപോലെ, സാധുക്കളായ ജനങ്ങൾക്കു യാതൊരു പ്രയോജനവുമില്ല. ഹോമിയോപ്പതിചികിത്സകൊണ്ടാണ് നാട്ടിൻപുറത്തുള്ള ജനങ്ങൾ തങ്ങളുടെ ആവശ്യങ്ങൾ നിറവേറുന്നത്. എന്നാൽ അതുതന്നെത്താനെ പ്രചാരത്തിൽ വരികയില്ലെ എന്നൊരു ചോദ്യത്തിന്നവകാശമുണ്ട്. പുത്തൻ കാര്യങ്ങൾ ഗുണകരമാണെന്ന ജനങ്ങളെ മനസ്സിലാക്കേണ്ടതു ഗവർണ്മെൻറിന്റെ ഒഴിച്ചുകൂടാത്തകടമയാണ്. പ്രത്യേകിച്ചും ഇതു ജീവനെസംബന്ധിച്ച കാര്യമാണല്ലൊ. ഇതിനെ വേഗത്തിൽ പ്രചാരത്തിൽ വരുത്തുകയും, അതിലേക്കു വേണ്ട ധനവ്യയം ഗവർണ്മെൻറു ചെയ്യുകയും ചെയ്യണം. ഇപ്പോൾ ഡാക്ടർമാരുടെ അത്യാഗ്രഹം കൊണ്ടും ഔഷധങ്ങളുടെ വിലക്കൂടുതൽ കൊണ്ടും അലോപ്പതി വൈദ്യത്തിൽ വളരെ അവിശ്വാസം ജനങ്ങളുടെ ഇടയിൽ ജനിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ട്. മരുന്നുതന്നെ ഒരു മാതിരി വെള്ളമെന്നല്ലാതെ വലിയ ഗുണമൊന്നുമില്ല. നല്ലതുകസംഭാവന ചെയ്താലേ നല്ല മരുന്നു കിട്ടുകയൊള്ളൂ. രോഗികളെ കാണിക്കാൻ കൊണ്ടുപോകണമെങ്കിൽ അതും വലിയ പ്രയാസം. ഡാക്ടർക്കുഇന്ന മൈലേജു കൊടുക്കണമെന്നു വിവരിക്കുന്ന ഒരു ബോഡ്ഡ് എഴുതിവയ്ക്കണമെന്നു ഞാൻ അനേകംതവണ ചോദ്യരൂപേണയും, ബഡ്ജറ്റ് പൊതുവിമർശനാവസരത്തിലും ഈ കൌൺസിലിൽ തന്നെ പ്രസ്ഥാപിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ട്. ഇതുകൊണ്ടു ഗവർണ്മെൻറിനു വലിയ ചിലവില്ല. അതു ചെയ്യാൻ പോലും ഡിപ്പാർട്ട്മെൻറു തയ്യാറല്ല. ഇ

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

ങ്ങിനെയാണ അലോപ്പതിയുടെ രീതി. പിന്നെ നാട്ടുവൈദ്യമുണ്ട്. അതി നുഗവർമ്മെൻറു ഒരുവിധം വേണ്ട സഹായം ചെയ്യുവരുന്നുണ്ട്. പക്ഷെ അതും ധനവ്യ : ം ധാരാളമുള്ളതും ഔഷധങ്ങൾ സേവിക്കുന്നതിനു അരു ചിയുള്ളതും ആണ്. ക്ലേശവേലക്കാക്കുടിയും യാതൊരുപഥ്യവും ആ ചരിക്കാതെ ഹോമിയോപ്പതിമരുന്നു സേവിക്കയും വേലയ്ക്കു പോകയും ചെയ്യാം. ഒരു ഡ്രാം പിൽസിനു ൫ അണയെ വിലയുള്ളു. ഒന്നോ രണ്ടോ ഗുളിക ഒന്നോ രണ്ടോ നേരംകൊടുത്താൽ മതി. ഉടനെതന്നെ ഗുണംകിട്ടും. മറു പല മരുന്നുകളും സേവിച്ചു അതിൽ ഒന്നും ഗുണം കിട്ടാതെ നിരാശയോടുകൂടിയിരിക്കുന്നവർക്കു ഒന്നരണ്ടുതവണ ഹോമിയോ പ്പതിമരുന്നു സേവിച്ചതുകൊണ്ടു ഗുണം കിട്ടീട്ടുണ്ട്. അതുകൊണ്ടു ഈ ചികിത്സാസമ്പ്രദായത്തെ ഗവർമ്മെൻറു നിശ്ചയമായും പ്രോത്സാഹി പ്പിക്കണം. ഉൾനാടുകളിൽ ഡാക്ടർമാരും ആശുപത്രികളും വളരെ കുറവാണ്. വിശേഷിച്ചും അവരെക്കൊണ്ടു ചികിത്സിപ്പിക്കുന്നതിനു ദരിദ്രന്മാർക്കു സാധിക്കയില്ല. അതുകൊണ്ടു ഉൾനാടുകളിൽ ഹോമിയോ പ്പതി ഡിസ്പെൻസറികൾ ഉടനടി സ്ഥാപിക്കണം. ഇതുയും പറഞ്ഞു കൊണ്ടു ഞാൻ ഈ പ്രമേയത്തെ ബലമായി പിൻതാങ്ങിക്കൊള്ളുന്നു.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*) : Sir, I oppose the resolution. I do so, not because I practise the Allopathic system of medicine, but because I honestly feel that Homeopathy as it is practised in Travancore at present, does not deserve encouragement at the hands of the Government. I listened with great interest to Mr. M. N. Pillai's speech and I had thought that before he finished I would have some information about Homeopathy, which would make me at least in some way support the motion. But I have been disappointed. If the paper had been read at the opening session of a School of Homeopathy it would have been appreciated. But Mr. M. N. Pillai has not advanced much in support of his resolution. I would not however join the opponents of Homeopathy and go so far as to denounce the father of Homeopathy, Dr. Hahnemann, as a fanatic and a knave or set aside Homeopathy as a fraud. I admit Hahnemann did a great deal in stimulating research on the action of drugs and Allopathists have to some extent been benefited by his work. Homeopathy is also reported to have had favourable results in the treatment of epidemics such as cholera and typhoid in Europe. I know that there are several persons practising Homeopathy in Travancore and also persons who believe in Homeopathy. But before accepting a resolution of this nature Government have to consider the interests of the people as a whole.

I shall now deal with the resolution as it stands and endeavour to show why I oppose the resolution. Mr. M.N.Pillai says in his resolution:

"This Council recommends to the Government that they be pleased to encourage Homeopathy by a liberal system of grants-in-aid to duly qualified practitioners of the system in Travancore."

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mrs. M. Poonon Lukose.]

Now by "duly qualified practitioners" I do not quite understand what he means. To me it is rather vague. I should like to know from Mr. M N. Pillai whether there are really many qualified practitioners in Homeopathy in Travancore. I do not think there are even half a dozen such men.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Are there duly qualified Allopathic doctors in Travancore?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Yes, there are qualified Allopathic doctors.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Is there any duly qualified Homeopathic practitioner in Travancore?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I do not say that there are no qualified practitioners. But I am not aware of anybody with such qualifications as are required of Homeopathists in European countries.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Is not Mr. M. N. Pillai himself a duly qualified doctor?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): That is a personal matter and I do not want to answer that.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Does Dr. Lukose want to base her arguments on her ignorance?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): What I meant was that I did not wish to touch on personal matters.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Is there any objection to give grant-in-aid to those who are duly qualified?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Sir, I may be questioned after I have finished my arguments.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN (*Muvattupuzha* cum *Todupuzha*): ഹൊമിയോപ്പതി വൈദ്യക്രമത്തെ ഗവർണ്മെൻറ് പ്രചരിപ്പിച്ചാൽ അലോപ്പതി വൈദ്യത്തിന് പ്രചാരം കുറഞ്ഞുപോകുമെന്നു വിചാരിക്കുന്നുണ്ടോ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): No, not at all. As far as I have been able to understand, Sir, all that is done by the majority of Homeopathists is to get a few books from Calcutta or other places and the supply of these books at home makes one in a very short time a successful Homeopath.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): May I know whether there are not several successful peons and compounders practising Allopathy?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): There are several peons and compounders practising Homeopathy. (*Laughter*).

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I am speaking of Allopathy.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): There may be peons and compounders practising Allopathy, but they are not regarded as qualified practitioners.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know whether there are not several hospitals manned by un-qualified Allopathic men?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): No. I do not know of hospitals manned by unqualified Allopathic men.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): There is a man in Aramboly in the Salvation Army Hospital who has not got any qualification.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I do not know the person he is referring to. I am not aware that the medical officer at Aramboly is unqualified. The institution at Aramboly is a grant-in-aid one and one of the conditions of giving grant-in-aid is that a medical man must hold the diploma of a recognised Allopathic school of medicine.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Am I to understand that no other is qualified to practise except those who have gone through a recognised Allopathic school?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I was saying that a grant-in-aid is given to an institution only if it satisfies the conditions of grant-in-aid.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Am I to understand that the person at present in the Aramboly Salvation Army Dispensary is a person who has had training?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I do not know the person. But he must have had sufficient training.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): What is the test?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): He must possess a recognised diploma.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): May I know whether there is any person in Travancore who is receiving grant but who has had no diploma?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I am not aware of any such person.

Then again, Sir, a standard of general education is not insisted upon before a man can practise Homeopathy. The majority of practitioners in Travancore have not the slightest knowledge of anatomy, physiology or pathology. They get down certain books, go through them at home and soon they become practitioners.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Do the Allopathic doctors prescribe without any reference to books?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Yes, they study books at home but Allopathic doctors do not

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mrs. M. Poonen Lukose.]

prescribe after *seeing the books* only. From what Mr. M. N. Pillai said about Homeopathy, he claims to treat all diseases and cure all diseases. If that were true, there will be no deaths and people will continue to live for ever and ever. I must say that Allopathy does not claim to cure all cases. It knows its limitations.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I said they can treat all cases.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Anyhow, that is the impression I got while listening to Mr. M. N. Pillai's speech.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I do not claim to cure all diseases.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Allopathy can also claim many miraculous cures. In the cases which have come under my notice Homeopathy has not been able to do any good where Allopathy failed though great hopes were raised at first. By this I do not mean to denounce Homeopathy. I will admit that in some cases Homeopathy does good.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): What I am saying is that such diseases are cured not by big doses but by small doses.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I do not know what the Homeopathic doses are. In some cases diplomas are sent from Colleges in America and Calcutta. The students do not take a course in a recognised school. Many of the Homeopathists in Travancore are people who have got diplomas by correspondence. My first point is that there are not in Travancore properly qualified Homeopathists.

The second part of the resolution says: "and by opening Homeopathic dispensaries and hospitals in places where there is a great demand for them". As I said before, there are people in Travancore who are treated by Homeopathists. Nobody objects to this. But the Government are not aware that there is a great demand for Homeopathy in Travancore.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Is the member aware that any member in the Popular Assembly moved for this?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): The subject was, I believe, brought up before the Popular Assembly.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Then how did she say that there was no demand?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Because one member advocated Homeopathy, it does not mean that there is a large demand.

MR. KURANDIPALLIL R. RAMAN PILLAI (*Quilon*): Is the member aware that the Madras Government have recognised bio-chemistry as a branch of Homeopathy?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Bio-chemistry is studied by Allopathists also.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): How did the Government try to understand that there is a real demand for Homeopathy?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): There has been no necessity till now to try to understand, because this is the only resolution that has come up on the subject. On the other hand, people in various rural areas are demanding loudly for Allopathic dispensaries.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Are the Government aware that there are several persons going in for Homeopathy?

MRS. M POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Yes.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Does it not show that there is a real demand?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): That does not necessarily follow.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): In places where there are successful Homeopathic practitioners, can you not say that there is a real demand for Homeopathy?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I cannot say.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Then how will the member explain the demand?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): It does not mean that because people are going in for it, that system is to be recognised by Government.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Can it not be ascertained by cures effected by Homeopathic doctors? Cannot the practical result be considered?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): To some extent it may.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Cannot the Government understand by the number of cases treated by these doctors and the number of cases cured by them that this treatment has been successful and that there is a demand on the part of the people?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): We cannot find it out easily, because who is to decide about the cures effected. There are, besides, severl other systems also which claim cures.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): We can understand that. Cannot the Government understand the need for this at present?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*) There is not sufficient need at present.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): May I know whether after receiving the resolution the Government attempted to take statistics?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): They did not take statistics. But the Government tried to find from Homeopathic practitioners and others what the general opinion is.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Has the question been considered by the Medical Board?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Yes.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil cum Devicolam*): Was this question referred to the Medical Board?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Yes, it was referred.

On the other hand, Sir, there has been a growing demand from the people for Allopathic and Ayurvedic systems of medicine and the Government have encouraged both these systems. So unless Mr. M. N. Pillai can convince me that, Homeopathy is being practised properly on Scientific lines in Travancore, I must oppose the resolution.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know from the member whether this system is more popular than Allopathy in the United States.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I would not say it is more popular,it has gained ground in America.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Is it being recognised by the Government?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*: I am not sure.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I shall assure the member that it is recognised by that Government.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know whether the member is aware that the doctor referred to by Mr. M. N. Pillai was at first an Allopathic doctor?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I do not know which doctor he means.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Is the Ayurvedic system a scientific system?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): It is.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Sir, I am quite in favour of the spirit of the resolution. I listened to the debate that took place between two experts in this House in regard to the acceptability or otherwise of the resolution. As a laymnan I must necessarily put my case. Of course, I was moved by the eloquent appeal of Dr. M. N. Pillai

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

in the course of his commending the resolution for the acceptance of this House. Sometimes I feel that I was in a railway carriage confronted by a person who goes about advertising tooth powder. It seems to me as a patent panacea for all ills certainly ; all lay men should necessarily accept the position adopted by Mr. M. N. Pillai. But a sense of humanity, Sir, impels me to speak in favour of this Homeopathic treatment for treating children sometimes when they suffer from headache or diarrhoea or some sort of no serious diseases. Even some parents resort to this kind of treatment. Allopathic treatment is quite disagreeable in the case of treatment of children.

Mr. M. N. Pillai bases the arguments upon a good deal of testimony. My sincere opinion is that the Government in accepting the resolution should give an undertaking to the effect that this system can be encouraged as a tentative measure. Sometimes when children suffer from headache my own experience is that they are really cured by these colourless doses. I am inclined to have some faith at least to give relief to these poor children and parents. Apart from all these considerations prudence will dictate that the Government should at least encourage all kinds of treatment such as Allopathy, Homeopathy, Ayurvedic and Chintamony. I have seen Sir, reported in a paper, that Henry Moore is certainly one of the intellects of the present day and he has established his reputation for machanism both for philosophy as well as in all branches of human knowledge. He has instituted a scheme in his factory. He has seven Doctors to treat his men in the factory and these Doctors are composed of both Homeopathic or Allopathic men. If there be any serious case in the factory what he does is, submit the patient to be examined by these seven persons and each of them to submit a report in respect of the disease. From their proposals he will choose the majority opinion. So I should think that is really most reliable, for I have never heard any two Doctors of the same opinion and it is no wonder to see that both Mrs. Poonen Lukose and Mr. M. N. Pillai are at poles apart. The House is composed of laymen who are responsible to their constituencies and as Mr. Piraviperumal Pillai observed yesterday prudence must be guided by prudence. Let us see different kinds of treatment Allopathy, Homeopathy Ayurvedic and Chintamony.

MR KURANDIPALLIL R. RAMAN PILLAI (*Quilon*) : What about Unani ?

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : I am obliged to my friend. Chintamony is more efficatious than Allopathy.

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*) : What about Naturapathy.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : My friend is an expert in that. I leave it to his opinion. In these days fasting is advocated as a panacea for all evils. I ask the House to be guided by prudence to recommend to Government so that they can extend uniformally, sympathy, encouragement, as also grant-in-aid to all these systems of treatment in which people have some confidence. It is true that in

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. M. Sivatanu Pillai.]

certain instances Homeopathic treatment proves more efficatious than Allopathic. As a representative of the clientale of both Allopathic and Homeopathic treatment I may say, Sir, that it is desirable that the Government should at least extend some encouragement to Homeopathy. With these few words, if Dr. M. N. Pillai has no objection to modify the resolution, that encouragement be given to Chintamony and other systems of treatment as well, I have not the slightest objection to support the resolution.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): May I ask Mr. Sivatanu Pillai whether, when he vehemently urged for opening a dispensary at Aramboly, he advocated the introduction of Homeopathy or Allopathy for the use of the public?

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): That is what really took place in connection with the location of the dispensary. People of that locality in general are not at all benefited by the dispensary. In the first place, the person who is in charge of the Hospital is not at all a competent hand. He was only a compounder before in a hospital which was housed in my compound. He is from a depressed class community and is only a layman. First he was a compounder in the Lutheran Mission Hospital and subsequently transferred to Putheri Hospital. I know him personally and I am sure he has had no training in any of the recognised Medical Schools. There is also another Mission Hospital which is manned with such unqualified men. Such institutions should never be given grant-in-aid at all. Such hospitals get grant-in-aid under pretext that they are treating the poor. Only redcoated men are considered poor and given free medical aid. All the other people of another community even if they are really poor, are denied aid. That is the reason why I want a dispensary to be opened there, particularly in a place where the people are very conservative. There is a Police sub-station and a Customs station. When the Inspecting Medical Officer was there I specially told him that a hospital is necessary at Aramboli for the reason that the one there, though it is receiving grant-in-aid is practically useless. The people have no other go. I implore the Government to locate the hospital as soon as possible at Aramboli.

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Are there people in favour of Homeopathic hospital.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Homeopathic treatment has not even reached the corner of Aramboli.

Moreover the majority of the villagers are really persons cutting firewood and consequently they get injury on account of falling from trees. For this, Allopathic system is the best form of treatment.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I do not think that the official member has in any way met the arguments advanced by Mr. M. N. Pillai. The chief objection raised was that Mr. M. N. Pillai has not established that this is based on any scientific system.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

The vast majority of persons here are not experts in medical science or any other science. We are only ordinary laymen who can understand things from practical standpoint alone. We can only view that from the point of usefulness of the treatment. The question whether Homeopathy is a scientific treatment may be left for the consideration of experts outside this country. If the treatment proves successful, why not give a grant. If some other system of treatment, say Chintamani, is useful to the public, the Government should give their support to that also. Moreover there are no Government experts in the Medical Board representing Ayurvedic and Chintamani treatment. I have also heard that the Government are refusing to give grant-in-aid in the case of Ayurvedic Doctors who are not able to show that that is based on a scientific system. For example, in the case of snake bite and dog bite case, the Government are not giving any sort of help. On general principles I suggest that the attitude taken by the Government is not proper. They must view the matter from the point of usefulness of the scheme.

The official member in reading out the resolution noticed that there are not duly qualified men well versed in Homeopathy. I understand that she herself admitted that she does not deny that there are no qualified men. Ignorance of the official member should not stand in the way of Government giving encouragement.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Torala*): Is the member aware of many practitioners of this system?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): If the questions have no relation to the arguments advanced by me I refuse to answer those questions.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Torala*): Is he aware of the existence of Homeopathic practitioners?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I believe I need not answer that question since it has no relevancy to the argument I am advancing.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Torala*): Does the member speak like this just to persuade the House to change its opinion?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I am not prepared to answer any question which I think irrelevant to the argument advanced by me. I am only giving my arguments.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Torala*): Is not the member seeking information?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): No. The official member based her arguments not upon facts but on her ignorance of the existence of duly qualified Homeopathic doctors. Whether there are duly qualified men or not, the only point to be observed is, whether the system of treatment is successful.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Sir, what I said was, as far as I am aware, there are not

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mrs. M. Poonen Lukose.]

many qualified people in Travancore in Homeopathy. I did not say that I do not know whether there are qualified men or not.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): If that is so, I am prepared to modify the argument.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Only when the member asked a personal question, I said that I would rather not answer it.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): If the Government admits that there are qualified practitioners in the Homeopathic system, then her arguments basing on the resolution do not stand.

So I submit there has not been any substantial argument put forward by the official side to meet the arguments raised by Mr. M. N. Pillai. So far as my information goes, I understand that several patients are going to Homeopathic practitioners for treatment. So, viewing it from the practical standpoint—

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Are there many such practitioners?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I may assure my friend Mr. Sivatanu Pillai that even without his putting this question to me I will deal the question from that aspect if I want to make use of that argument. At present I have not made any argument on that point.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know which aspect of the question he is now dealing with?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I am coming to that. If my friend Mr. Sivatanu Pillai will patiently hear what I have to say in regard to that—

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): I just want to ascertain one point from my friend Mr. Joseph. In the absence of any definite information as to the availability of duly qualified Homeopathic practitioners is it the position of the member that the House must give the benefit of the doubt to the resolution?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I did not say that qualified persons were not available, nor did I say that they were available. As the resolution stands at present, the only point is with reference to the question of giving encouragement to duly qualified practitioners of the system. If there are duly qualified persons and if they are rendering useful service to the people, then I submit, it is time for the Government to help these people. I understand that several persons are seeking the aid of these practitioners and that they are being successfuly treated by them. Mr. M. N. Pillai himself said that 90 per cent. of the cases undertaken by him were being successfully treated. He also said that there were several qualified practitioners. Under such circumstances, I do not find any reason for not supporting this resolution

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

If the Government find that there are not duly qualified persons then, they need not give any encouragement. The question whether I am posted with any opinion as regards the number of qualified persons is not at all material to the discussion of this resolution. Whether I am, in my personal capacity, posted with that information does not in any way affect the argument that I now advance. It may be that Mr. M. N. Pillai or somebody else may be aware of the number of duly qualified persons. Mr. M. N. Pillai may be aware of many such qualified persons. I may be aware of a few. There may be others who are not aware of any at all. These factors do not in any way advance or retard the intrinsic merits of the arguments advanced on behalf of this resolution. So, my point is that considering the usefulness, the cheapness and other advantages of this system, I think it is high time that the Government should help and encourage this system. If the Government feels any real diffidence in the matter they should at least do something by way of experiments. Just as they did in the case of Ayurveda by starting an Ayurvedic dispensary, the Government may, in the same way, try a Homeopathic dispensary in Trivandrum itself and see how it works. Under these circumstances, I think the Government should, in fairness, accept the resolution as it stands and not oppose it.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): Sir, when I came to this House this morning I never thought that this resolution would be opposed at all. The resolution only says:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that they be pleased to encourage Homeopathy by a liberal system of grants in aid to duly qualified practitioners of the system in Travancore and by opening Homeopathic dispensaries and hospitals in places where there is a great demand for them".

I do not see what objection there is for the Government's accepting this resolution. If there are not duly qualified persons the Government need not give any encouragement. If there are duly qualified persons, then let the Government encourage them. At present Sir, the representative of this Taluk has come forward and said that the people want a Homeopathic hospital. We are in openminded toleration now spending large amounts from public funds for the Allopathic system. Then, why not, I say, give the people of a particular taluk who come forward through their representative, through their mouth-piece, and say that they want a Homeopathic dispensary, why not we give it to them? After all, the resolution is very innocent and harmless and useful. I therefore do not see the reason why it should not be accepted.

Then the question was raised as to whether it was a scientific system or not. That is a point which we laymen cannot discuss; and I perfectly agree with my friend Mr. K. I. Joseph when he said that it was only the usefulness that has to be looked into in such matters. It is the patient that has got to be cured and it is the will of the patient that has got to prevail; not whether the system is scientific or not.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. S. Piraviperumal Pillai.]

In regard to this point, at the outset, I may say that I am alive to the fear that it may be doubted what special qualifications I possess for supporting the cause of a highly scientific subject like Homeopathy, which is the nightmare of the orthodox school of physicians. The answer is simple. In the first place, I have behind me the experience of a personal sufferer, which is myself, who found relief in Homeopathic treatment after fruitless attempts of alleviation and palliation of my troubles from other systems at great personal inconvenience and heavy doctor's bills.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : Is the member quite sure that it was not by accident that he was cured after he took Homeopathic medicine ?

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*) : Whether it was by accident, or not, I cannot say. I am speaking from my own experience.

I have also at the back of me the evidence of thousands of sufferers like me who unsolicitedly and unstintingly testify to the efficiency, cheapness and convenience of the Homeopathic treatment. It must be admitted that it is to the patient that the physician prescribes, and naturally therefore it is the patient's verdict that must prevail. I am not to be misunderstood as insinuating undesirable inferences against any individual or against any school of physicians. Far from it ; as a genuine lover of Homeopathy, my love having been engendered by positive experience, it is my only wish to support the cause, and in special pleading it is not possible to help referring to certain facts which are pregnant with meaning.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : May I know the nature of the disease that my friend was ailing under ?

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*) : Sir, I would like to have a ruling as to whether that question arises now.

PRESIDENT : It is not admissible.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*) : Any how I can reply the member. I may assure him that it was not *insomnia*.

The genesis and growth of Homeopathy is one long tale of woe of sufferings amounting to little short of absolute privation of martyrs who lived and died for the cause of truth unmindful of the patronage of the present generation or the judgment of the future. It will bring tears to the eyes of any unsophisticated, dispassionate reader who peruses the life of Dr. Samuel Hahnemann, the discoverer and founder of Homeopathy, to whom it was vouchsafed to get a glimpse of natural laws co-eternal with truth, and who after the realisation of the truth sacrificed a lucrative practice, lived the life of an exile fleeing from one civilised country to another, struggled for mere existence and support

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

of a large family, kept vigil every other night translating books to earn the wherewithal to keep alive, and not stopping to practise the system of medicine, the hollowness of which he had exposed erstwhile, and met on every side with opposition fostered by prejudice, lack of research, want of the spirit of enquiry, and total absence of openmindedness which must characterise the scientist. All this was nothing by the side of the opposition which was put up by vested interest. His discoveries and his practice in the light of his convictions jeopardised the interests of the chartered company of Apothecaries, Chemists and Pharmaceutists, with which the interests of the physicians were closely linked up. To state in simple language, it was the compounders and chemists who gave the cue, and the manufacturers and merchants joined the cry. And in countries where commerce and industries wirepulled the Government, it is nothing strange that the Government should have adopted aggressive measures or should have been apathetic. England, in its isolation, is proverbially conservative and its Government is controlled by commerce. And all who imbibe the spirit of England and learn the medical lore of England's orthodox school are guided by the consensus of public opinion which is moulded by the orthodox school of physicians. Fortunately for us, our State is not controlled by this school or that which has got its vested interest to safeguard. In the spirit of open-minded toleration we admitted the advent of Allopathic practice in our State and support it largely from public finance. The same spirit must guide us when we consider the claims of Homeopathy for an equal recognition and patronage.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): What does he say with regard to the *Chintamany* system of treatment?

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): I have no objection to that being encouraged.

It is an unchallenged fact that Homeopathy is based on universal laws which are co-eternal with truth. The experience of a century and a half has not shaken popular faith in its efficiency. The rationale of its simple formula *similia similibus curantur* or "Cure like with the like" has been borne out by scientific truths discovered since. Hidden truths brought to light by the spectroscope, conclusions legitimately drawn from the electron theory, the discoveries of J. C. Bose in plant life, the cosmic laws which harmonise with the laws that govern the rhythm of human life, fully support the unshaken foundation on which Homeopathy rests. It has evolved from its basic principle which recognises the inherence of the pathogenetic or disease-producing property and the therapeutic or disease curing property in the same drug. The rationale of its scientific basis is evident from the historic fact that Hahnemann prescribed the specific for the cure of Asiatic Cholera when it broke out in the Austrian Army even when he had not seen a case of attack himself, but had before him only the report of the symptoms manifested to guide him in the selection of the similium.

It is a system which is cheap. A house-holder can have a small chest and can be his own doctor and that of his neighbours. It is the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. S. Piraviperumal Pillai.]

system for the poor. It is the system largely practised by the missionary bodies who render medical relief among the poor. It is a system which every progressive country unshackled by prejudice has learnt to patronise. It is a system the practice of which every Government in Continental Europe has supported by legislative measures, a system for the treating of which every Continental University has instituted foundations, a system born in Scientific Germany and fostered on the lap of Independent America, a system which has at last been recognised quite of late by H. R. H The Prince of Wales.

In the face of such overwhelming testimony, is it not within the limits of legitimate right for this system to claim patronage at the hands of the Government? Is it not our duty to ventilate popular opinion in the matter and help the people whom we represent to realize their will? Is it not incumbent on us to encourage a system of medicine which by virtue of its simplicity, cheapness and efficiency has gained popular favour in our State? Last, but not least, is it not our duty to help forward a system which by its cheapness will help us in turn to effect economy, in the funds allotted for medical relief, without sacrificing efficacy?

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know what the member has to say with regard to the question whether there are the necessary number of duly qualified Homeopathic practitioners so that the Government may think of giving liberal grants-in-aid to them?

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): That is only the *modus operandi*, after the principle of the resoultion is accepted. If there are qualified practitioners, let the Government encourage them. If not, they need not. That is a matter which is not relevant to the subject of the resolution.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Does the member mean to support the resolution if there are not sufficient number of such practitioners?

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): The question of the number of practitioners does not come in at all. If the Government find that there are duly qualified practitioners let them encourage. If not, they need not.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know whether he is aware of the existence of a number of duly qualified Homeopathic practitioners?

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): That point, as I have already stated, has nothing to do with this resolution. I shall gladly give my friend any information that he wants if he would kindly go over to my house.

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*): Sir, Homeopathy has suffered a great deal by the excessive zeal displayed by its votaries. (*Louder, please.*) It has also suffered a great deal, because it is capable of being practised by quacks and charlatans and

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

utterly inexperienced persons; and the more incompetent and inexperienced a person is, the greater and more extravagant is the claim to omnipotence put forward by him. I have had experience of a Homeopathic practitioner falling foul of me because I was not prepared to subscribe to all that he said, to all the wonders that he said he could perform without any difficulty, without any recourse to surgery. A great deal of prejudice has been generated against Homeopathy in these ways. But, as Mrs. Lukose admitted and as very eminent Allopathic doctors have admitted, Homeopathy has made substantial contribution towards the improvement of medical practice. For example, formerly the practice was, to give large doses of medicine. Now I think, Allopathy has turned round to the principle that it is not desirable to drug the patient with large quantities of drugs. That view point, I think, was brought about to some extent at least, by the precept and practice of Homeopathy. We have heard a great deal about the opposition offered to Homeopathy because of vested interests, and by shop-keepers and compounders and medicine vendors. No doubt, there might have been opposition offered by vested interests when they found that their business was affected by the spread of Homeopathy. But I am sure that is not mainly the ground for opposing wholesale the claim put forward by Homeopathic practitioners. In all civilised countries the practice of medicine is controlled by a body of responsible and scientific men and it is not possible, and it is not desirable that the Government should accept any system put forward by any quack. Every day we find quacks coming forward with wonderful claims. It may be to-day about water-cure; to-morrow about another thing and the day after to-morrow, a third. It may be that some of these may have some truths and some substance in them. But that is no reason why a responsible body of medical practitioners should accept unreservedly all the claims, extravagant and unreasonable sometimes, put forward by all sorts of systems, Homeopathy, water-cure etc., That is why responsible men in England and other places have been exercising caution in accepting Homeopathy. We are not therefore justified in saying that there are vested interests working against Homeopathy.

So far as this particular system is concerned, as I said, some of the most eminent Allopathic doctors have admitted its contributions towards the alleviation of human suffering and it is not necessary at this time of the day to say anything about the merits of Homeopathy, because other civilised countries, particularly America, have to some extent recognised it. The Governments in America as well as in certain European countries have recognised the practice of Homeopathy. In India also, as Dr. M. N. Pillai has been telling us, the Madras Minister of Health gave his countenance to the starting of a free Homeopathic dispensary in the city of Madras. And in some Native States also, I think, some steps have been taken in that direction. I do not think there is any justification for saying that Homeopathy is altogether an exploded or useless system of treatment. It has got its virtues undoubtedly. But the great difficulty is that there are not sufficiently qualified doctors of Homeopathy. In this country we have not got well-equipped colleges

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. K. C. Mammen Mappillai.]

to teach Homeopathy. It is also unfortunate that there are persons and institutions prepared to grant any degree, M. D. or L. R. C. P., in Homeopathy to any person who applies and pays some money. This practice also has contributed to bring about discredit to the system.

Our Government has been the first to set an example in encouraging the Ayurvedic system by its patronage.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Is it not now admitted to be a scientific system?

MR. K. C. MAMMEN MAPPILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, North*): I was going to say that there was a time when the Ayurvedic system was considered an unscientific system and a lot of redicule was being poured on it. I remember a speech by a Surgeon General in the Madras Legislative Council rediculing the whole system because it bases all its treatments on three principles, Vatham, Pitham, Kapham. The whole thing is an absurdity. But we find now that a great number of persons have come round to recognise that there are invaluable truths enshrined in the Ayurvedic system. Western medical people are in the habit of saying that certain systems are unscientific because they have not studied it and are making hasty conclusions. That is no reason why we should think that it has not been found to be useful. There is also another consideration. The number of trained doctors in our country or in any part of India, is very small and taking the whole population and the number of doctors we have into consideration, we shall be surprised to find how few trained doctors there are in the country. Consequently, they have to resort to all kinds of quacks. Therefore, I think, it would be only an act of generosity, if our Government would do something towards the recognition of Homeopathy for the benefit of the poorer classes in this country who can undoubtedly derive help from the Homeopathic treatment, (*hear, hear*). As I said, before the Madras Government or any other Government gave recognition to Ayurvedic treatment our Government was the first to give recognition to that system. The Government of Travancore had the foresight to lead the way in that direction. I must say that there is no harm in our showing some recognition for the Homeopathic treatment. Claims may be put forward that we have not got colleges here properly kept and persons who have received scientific instructions. That is one drawback. But there may be persons who have studied in America where they have got colleges for teaching Homeopathy through professors who are as eminent as any other teachers in Allopathic system. Therefore the resolution put forward is quite harmless. It only requests that due encouragement may be given to duly qualified persons and it is left to the discretion of Government to lay down rules as to what the proper qualification should be. With that safeguard I do not at all see that there is any harm in accepting the resolution as it is. I hope the House will accept the resolution.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Sir, between Dr. M. N. Pillai's speech which, as it appeared to Mrs. Lukose, would have done much credit to him had it been delivered before an assemblage of Homeopathic students and the statesman like utterance of Mrs. Lukose, a layman like myself would find it rather difficult to make up his mind on a question like this. But the matter having been placed before the Council and, as luck would have it, I being in the Council, I feel called upon to express what I think upon the question that has been placed before it. With reference to the efficacy of the system of treatment known as Homeopathy, as my friend Mr. K. C. Mammen Mappillai said it is not open to any radical attack. It has gained ground in many civilised countries and at this stage of its progress and development even if the Medical Board of Travancore were to give it out as their considered opinion that it is unsupportable it would only afford matter to estimate the value of the opinion of the Board and not any ground to condemn the system. Thus as to the system of treatment, it is above criticism and cavail. Mrs. Lukose herself has been quite fair in saying that as a system of treatment she has absolutely no objection to its being encouraged. Her trouble arose mainly with respect to a portion of the resolution, where it speaks of duly qualified men. First of all during her speech she informed the House that she did not quite understand that. But in explaining herself during the speech of Mr. Joseph she told the House that she knew that there are qualified men but she did not think that they are many. So, that also does not present any serious difficulty. Even in her information there are qualified men, but according to her ambit of knowledge they are not many. So, that is not a ground to oppose the resolution. Then what really stands in the way of the resolution being accepted by the Council has not been explained at all. It is an innocuous resolution, as has been pointed out by Mr. Piraviperumal Pillai. What the resolution says is that, if there are qualified men according to the estimate of the Government, please encourage them. That is all.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Is it not a waste of time of the House to discuss such a resolution?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): It would not be.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Am I to understand that it is an academical discussion?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): It is not a question of academical nature either. It is a question of practical politics.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Does it not require the acceptance of the principle of the resolution?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Yes. If you offer the necessary encouragement there will be men.

Then Sir, I would view the question in relation to the medical relief in the State. I quote a few figures from a recent speech by the Honourable Dr. U. Rama Rao. I find that in civilised countries like England, America and Japan there are on the average six medical practitioners

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai.]

in rural areas and 12 medical practitioners in urban areas to afford medical relief for every ten thousand people. Calculated on that basis, the learned Doctor comes to the conclusion that there should be at least 24 thousand practioners in the whole of the Madras Presidency. But on the whole they have got only 2500 medical men. That shows how poorly medical assistance has been provided for in the Madras Presidency. Coming to Travancore we have got a population of more than 40 lakhs of people and the medical officers appointed by Government—the duly qualified set of people—come to 142, inclusive of the 3 members of the Medical Board and two female apothecaries, and the temporary sub-assistant surgeons. Thus we see the State is now maintaining 142 medical officers for a population of 40 lakhs and more. It works out, on an average, at the rate of one medical officer for 30,000 people and how inadequate the medical relief that is now provided for is apparent from that ratio compared with what is obtaining in other parts of the world.

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Cannot the people of Travancore be healthier than others?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Unfortunately the latest information upon the subject is quite the other way. The present Dewan of Travancore has to be congratulated upon what he has been able to secure in the shape of further medical research to successfully combat, the prevelent diseases in Travancore by the recent alliance that he has entered into with the Rockfeller Foundation (*Hear, Hear.*) I have been informed, I speak subject to correction, that the prevalence of Hook worm disease is so extensive in Travancore that it comes up to the figure of 82 to 90 per cent in certain centres and that it appears, the range of hook-worm ravages is so vast as to make the entire forces in the medical service of the state quite inadequate to operate in that single arena. To say, therefore, that this provision of one doctor for 30,000 people is adequate because of the healthy condition of the country is wide of the truth. So, I just indicate the fact of the extreme inadequacy of medical help that the Government has provided for the entire State.

MR. G. RAMAN MENON (*Mavelikara* cum *Kartikapalli*): Does the number include the Ayurvedic vaidyans also?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): No.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): Does he include the Mission hospitals and private practitioners also?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): No, I do not say that the only medical assistance available is through the channel of 142 officers. People are curing themselves, they are combating the diseases; they spare no pains to postpone the evil hour by resorting to other systems like Dr. M. N. Pillai's and Ayurveda which used to be condemned by the rancorous advocates of the Allopathic system. The Allopathists hold no monopoly of health, and it was with refreshing pleasure that I listened to Mrs. Lukose when she said that Ayurveda

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

is based upon scientific lines. That required a very severe struggle, not only here, but elsewhere, before recognition was given to the Ayurveda system.

With respect to the Homeopathic system I have heard various gibes hurled against it. They say it is an inch of medicine with acres of faith. (*Laughter*) That is one of the usual gibes. Unfortunately there are certain passages in the speech delivered by Dr. M. N. Pillai which would also lend support to an unsympathetic critic or a cynically minded person to make further gibes on the system. For example he himself was telling us that their medicines are tasteless.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): And colourless too.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): This may mean medicines do not consist of anything other than aqua, H_2O, as the chemist would call it.

He said that surgical operations are not needed at all in his system. That reminds me of an answer to an apothecary by his own waiter who announced the arrival of a customer. He asked his waiter whether it was an old or new customer to which the waiter replied that no old customer would ever return to him. (*Laughter.*) So if the surgical operations may be avoided in the system, something very serious may be said of the system by a cynically minded man. Apart from the jocular way of looking at it, we have to take into consideration what has been actually done by the Homeopathic doctors. In Trivandrum and Kottayam where I have been living for some time, I am in a position to say that the assistance of the Homeopathic doctor is availed of to a very great extent by the people. Dr. M. N. Pillai himself is not prepared to confine this system of treatment to children but wants, as Mr. Mammen Mappillai puts it, to cover a larger area. If successful doctors like Dr. M. N. Pillai and others are able to treat at least the children is it not a great gain I ask? Let us also take into consideration the expenses involved in these systems of treatment.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): Is it not possible under this system of treatment to minimise the large amount of expenditure?

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Certainly; that is what I say. If the children can be treated successfully, is it not something to encourage? Well, as I said, the question of expenditure also is a matter for consideration. Does Mrs. Lukose really know or understand fully the greediness, the heedlessness and inefficiency of some of the Allopathic gentlemen in the department? Do they pay at least anything like proper attention to patients? From one Durbar Physician I have had the clearest testimony that many of the doctors in his experience did not pay anything like serious attention to patients but were clamorous for pay and positions. I know instances where medical practitioners have refused to attend patients unless paid beforehand. While such is the system of Allopathy that has been provided by

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai.]

the Medical Board of Travancore, to say that the Medical Board is not in sympathy with or cannot encourage the system of Homeopathy is a proposition which needs only to be stated to be scouted. We have very poor people here in Travancore and they are unable to pay these Allopathic cormorants. Some of them even if paid are not prepared to pay as much attention to their patients as a student of science is expected to bestow. Such being the case, if there is at least one enthusiastic qualified person who follows the Homeopathic system, to say that he should not be encouraged because he does not come up to the standards of the Medical Board in the State of Travancore is a proposition which cannot be listened to. Under these circumstances with very great pleasure, Sir, I beg to support the resolution moved by Mr. M. N. Pillai.

The Council adjourned for launch at 2-11 P. M. and re-assembled at 2-54 P. M.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*) : ഈ പ്രമേയത്തെ ഞാൻ ബലമായി അനുകൂലിക്കുന്നു. ഈ പ്രമേയത്തിനു ഇത്രവളരെ സമയം ചിലവാക്കേണ്ടിവരുമെന്നോ, ഗവർമ്മെൻറു ഭാഗത്തുനിന്നും ഇതിനു എതിരഭിപ്രായം വരുമെന്നോ ഞാൻ വിചാരിച്ചിരുന്നില്ല. മിസ്സസ് ലൂക്കോസിന്റെ പ്രസംഗം കഴിഞ്ഞതിൽ പിന്നീടാണ് പ്രമേയത്തെപറ്റി രണ്ടു വാക്കുപറയണമെന്ന് എനിക്കു തോന്നാൻ ഇടയായതു്. മിസ്സസ് ലൂക്കോസിന്റെ മറുപടി ആവശ്യത്തിൽ സപല്ലം ക്രൂരതയായിട്ടാണ് ഞാൻ കരുതുന്നതു്. അതിനുകാരണം ഹോമിയോപ്പതിചികിത്സയെപറ്റിയുള്ള അവരുടെ അറിവിന്റെ കുറവാണ്. ഈ പ്രമേയത്തിൽപറയുന്നതു് ഹോമിയോപതി ചികിത്സയിൽ അനുത്തരപന്മാരായ ആളുകൾ ഉണ്ടെങ്കിൽ അവരെ ഗവർമ്മെൻറു സഹായിക്കണമെന്നുമാത്രമാണ്. അങ്ങിനെ ആളുകൾ ഉണ്ടെന്നുബോദ്ധ്യം വരുന്ന പക്ഷം അവക്കുസഹായധനം നൽകേണ്ടതും അത്യാവശ്യമാണ്. എന്നാൽ മിസ്സസ് ലൂക്കോസ് പറയുന്നതു് ഇതിനു അനുത്തരപന്മാരായ ആളുകൾഉണ്ടോ എന്നുള്ള സംഗതി സംശയമെന്നാണ്. എന്നാൽ ഇംഗ്ലീഷ് ചികിത്സയിൽ അനുത്തരപന്മാരായ യോഗ്യന്മാരെക്കൊണ്ടാണോ ഇന്നത്തെ ആശുപത്രികൾ നടത്തിപോരുന്നതു് എന്നുള്ള സംഗതിയെപ്പറ്റിയാലോചിക്കുമ്പോൾ ജനങ്ങൾക്കു വളരെയായ ഇശ്വാഭംഗത്തിനാണ് ഇടയുള്ളതു്. അതിനെപറ്റി എന്റെ സ്നേഹിതൻ മി: ശിവതാണുപിള്ള രണ്ടു ദൃഷ്ടാന്തങ്ങൾ ഇവിടെ പറകയുണ്ടായി. ഈ ദൃഷ്ടാന്തങ്ങൾക്കു കാരണമായ ആശുപത്രികൾ ആരുവാമൊഴിയിലും മേക്കാ

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

മണ്ഡപത്തും ഉള്ളവയാണ്. ആരുവാമൊഴിയിലുള്ള ആശുപത്രിയെ പററി അദ്ദേഹത്തിന്ന നല്ലവണ്ണം അറിയാം. അതുപോലെ മേക്കാ മണ്ഡപം ആശുപത്രിയെപററി പറയാൻ എനിക്കും അറിവുള്ളതാ ണ്. മേക്കാമണ്ഡപം ആശുപത്രി എന്റെ വീട്ടിന്ന ഏററവും സമീപ ത്തുള്ളതാണ്. ഈ ആശുപത്രിയിൽ മിസ്സസ് ലൂക്കോസ് പറയുന്ന മാതിരിയുള്ള duly qualified men ഉണ്ടോ എന്ന അവർ പരിശോധി ക്കേണ്ടതാണ്. മിഷൻ ആശുപത്രികളിലെ ഉദ്യോഗസ്ഥന്മാരെ സൃ ഷ്ടിക്കുന്നതിന്ന അവർ ഒരു ക്ലാസ് ഏർപ്പെട്ടുത്തീട്ടുണ്ട്. അവിടെ ഏ താനും കൊല്ലം പഠിച്ചവരെ ഡാക്ടർ മാരായിട്ട അയക്കയാണ് ചെ യ്യുന്നത്. ആ സ്കൂളിൽ എത്രകൊല്ലം പഠിക്കണമെന്നും, ഇതിനെ ആരാണ് പരിശോധിക്കേണ്ടതെന്നും, ഇവർപുറമെ ഇറങ്ങി ചികിത്സ ക്കാൻ യോഗ്യന്മാരാണോഎന്നും, ഗവർണ്മെൻറിന്ന നല്ലപോലെ അറിയാ മെന്ന ഞാൻ വിചാരിക്കുന്നില്ല. അതിന്റെ പരമാർത്ഥസ്ഥിതി ഗ വർണ്മെൻറിന്ന അറിയാമായിരുന്ന എങ്കിൽ ഇന്നത്തെ ഡാക്ടർമാരിൽ പലരും ആ സ്ഥാപനങ്ങളിൽ ഉണ്ടായിരിക്കയില്ലായിരുന്ന. ഇപ്പോൾ ഹോമിയോപ്പതിക്കുവന്നിട്ടുള്ള അബദ്ധം ഡ്യൂലികപാളിഫൈഡ്, എന്ന വാക്കു ഉപയോഗപ്പെടുത്തത്തക്കവണ്ണം ഗവർണ്മെൻറു സ്വീകരിച്ചിട്ട ള്ളതായ ഒരു പാഠശാല ഇല്ലെന്നുള്ളതാണ്. എന്നാൽ അതിലേക്കു കൽക്കട്ടായിൽ ഒരു സ്കൂൾ ഉണ്ടെന്നും അവിടെ മൂന്ന കൊല്ലം പഠിക്കണ മെന്നും കാണുന്നു. ആ സ്ഥാപനത്തെപ്പററി ഗവർണ്മെൻറു വേണ്ട അ ന്വേഷണങ്ങളും നടത്തി സ്വീകരിക്കാവുന്നതാണ്.

ഇപ്പോൾ ഹോമിയോപ്പതി ചികിത്സ പ്രചാരത്തിൽ ഇരിക്കുന്ന ണ്ടോ എന്നും അതനുസരിച്ചു ചികിത്സിക്കത്തക്കയോഗ്യന്മാരുണ്ടോ എ ന്നും മിസ്സസ് ലൂക്കോസിനറിഞ്ഞുകൂടാ. എന്നാൽ അനുഭവസ്ഥന്മാരായ ആളുകൾ കൌൺസിൽമുമ്പാകെപറയുന്നതിനെ ഗവർണ്മെൻറു വിശ്വ സിക്കേണ്ടതാണ്. എന്റെ വീട്ടിൽ കുട്ടികൾക്കു (ഹൂപ്പിങ്ങ്കാഫ്) മൂപ്പുറവുമ എന്ന ഒരു സുഖക്കേടുണ്ടായി. അടുത്തുള്ള ഡാക്ടർമാർ എന്റെ പ്രത്യേകസ്നേഹിതന്മാരാകയാൽ അവർ വളരെ താല്പര്യത്തോട്ട കൂടി ചികിത്സിച്ചു. എന്നിട്ടും യാതൊരുഭേദവും ഉണ്ടാകാതെ കുട്ടി കൾ അപരിമിതമായ സങ്കടം അനുഭവിക്കേണ്ടതായിവന്ന. അതിൽ പിന്നീട്ട ഞാൻ ഡാക്ടർ എം. എൻ. പിള്ളയുടെ അടുക്കൽവരികയും മരുന്നവാങ്ങിക്കൊടുക്കയും ചെയ്തപ്പോൾ വളരെഎളുപ്പം ഭേദമായി.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. T. Kumara Pillai.]

രണ്ടാമതു മി: പിറവിപെരുമാൾപിള്ള പറഞ്ഞതുപോലെ എന്റെ സ്വന്ത അനുഭവത്തെക്കൂടി പറയാം.

എനിക്കു ഒരു വയറുവേദനയുടെ ഉപദ്രവമായിരുന്നു. എന്റെ സ്നേഹിതന്മാരായ പലഡാക്ടർമാരും പലവിധമായ ചികിത്സകൾചെയ്തു. ഒടുവിൽ അവർപറഞ്ഞതു ആഹാരം നിയന്ത്രിച്ചാൽമതിയാകുമെന്നാണു്. അവർ പറഞ്ഞതനുസരിച്ചു ആഹാരം നിയന്ത്രിച്ചു. എന്നിട്ടും ഭേദംഉണ്ടായില്ല. ഒടുവിൽ ഡാക്ടർ എം. എൻ. പിള്ളയുടെ മരുന്നുസേവിച്ചു. രോഗം നിഷ്പ്രയാസം മാറി. എന്നെപ്പോലെതന്നെ ഹോമിയോപ്പതിവൈദ്യത്തെപ്പറ്റി അഭിപ്രായം പറയാവുന്ന പലരും ഈ തിരുവനന്തപുരംടൗണിൽ ഉണ്ടെന്നാണു് ഞാൻ വിചാരിക്കുന്നതു്. ഈ പരമാർത്ഥമായ സംഗതി മിസ്സസ്. ലൂക്കോസു ഇതുവരെ അറിഞ്ഞിട്ടില്ലെങ്കിൽ അതു് ഇംഗ്ലീഷ് ചികിത്സയോടുള്ള അപരിമിതമായ വാത്സല്യവും മറു ചികിത്സയോടുള്ള അപരിമിതമായ ദ്വേഷവുംകൊണ്ടു മാത്രമാണെന്നു് ഞാൻ വിചാരിക്കുന്നു.

ഏതെങ്കിലും ഒരുസംഗതി തനിക്കറിയാൻ സാധിച്ചിട്ടില്ലെങ്കിൽ അതിനെ ആക്ഷേപിക്ക എന്നുള്ളസ്വഭാവം നന്നാണെന്നു ഞാൻ വിചാരിക്കുന്നില്ല. എത്രയോ നിഷ്പ്രയാസമായികൊണ്ടുവന്നിരിക്കുന്ന ഈ പ്രമേയത്തെ ഗവർണ്മെൻറു വേണ്ടപോലെ ആലോചിച്ചു് അതിനനുരൂപന്മാരായ യോഗ്യന്മാക്കു സഹായധനം കൊടുക്കേണ്ടതാണു്. പൊതുജനങ്ങൾക്കു ഈ വൈദ്യസമ്പ്രദായം വളരെ ഉപകാരപ്രദമായിട്ടുതീരുമെന്നുള്ളതിൽ യാതൊരുസംശയവുമില്ല. വിശേഷിച്ചും ബാലചികിത്സയിൽ ഇതിനു അപരിമിതമായ ഗുണങ്ങൾ കണ്ടുവരുന്നു. എന്റെ സ്നേഹിതന്മാരിൽ പലരും അവരവരുടെ വീടുകളിൽ ഹോമിയോപ്പതി ചികിത്സയ്ക്കുള്ള പുസ്തകവും, മരുന്നുകളും വാങ്ങിച്ചുവച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു. കുട്ടികൾക്കുണ്ടാകുന്ന സുഖക്കേടുകളെ തന്നത്താനെ ചികിത്സിക്കയും വലിയ സുഖക്കേടുകൾ വരുമ്പോൾ ഡാക്ടർ എം. എൻ. പിള്ളയേയൊ മറേറാ വരുത്തികാണിച്ചു് ചികിത്സിക്കയും ചെയ്യുന്നുണ്ടു്. ഭൂതപ്പാണ്ടിയിൽ ഒരു ആശുപത്രി വേണമെന്നു ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടപ്പോൾ, എന്റെ സ്നേഹിതന്മാരാരോ അവിടെ ഒരു ഹോമിയോപ്പതി ആശുപത്രികൊണ്ടു മതിയാകുമോ എന്നു ചോദിച്ചു. ഹോമിയോപ്പതി വൈദ്യത്തെപ്പറ്റി ഉൾനാട്ടിലെ ജനങ്ങൾക്കു അറിഞ്ഞുകൂടാ. അവക്കറിയാവുന്നതു ഇംഗ്ലീഷ് ചികിത്സയാണു്. ഇപ്പോൾ ഇവിടെ ഒരു

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

മെഡിക്കൽ ബോർഡുണ്ട്. അവരുടെ കീഴ്വരുതിയിൽ അനേകം ആ ശുപത്രികളുംഉണ്ട. അനേകം ഡാക്ടർമാരുംഉണ്ട്. അവർ ഏതുനി ലയിൽ പൊതുജനങ്ങളെ ആദരിക്കുന്നു എന്നു മി: പി. കെ. നാരായണ പിള്ള ഒരുവിധം ഭംഗിയായി പറഞ്ഞു. അദ്ദേഹം ഒന്നും കൂട്ടതലായി ട്ടുപറഞ്ഞില്ല. അദ്ദേഹം പറഞ്ഞതുതന്നെ വളരെ കുറവായിപ്പോയി എന്നാണ് എന്റെ അഭിപ്രായം. ചിലഡാക്ടർമാർ നടത്തിപ്പോരുന്ന അനീതികളെമെഡിക്കൽ ബോഡിനു നിയന്ത്രിക്കാൻ സാധിക്കുമോ എന്നു ഞാൻ സംശയിക്കുന്നു.

MR. K. MADHAVAN PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Nedumangad*): Has Mr. Kumara Pillai anything to say against the way in which the cholera epidemic was managed, in South Travancore recently?

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): ഈസംഗതി ഇപ്പോൾ എന്നെ ഓർമ്മിപ്പിച്ചതിനു ഞാൻ നന്ദിപറഞ്ഞുകൊള്ളുന്നു. ഞാൻ പൊതുക്കായ്ങ്ങൾക്കിറങ്ങീട്ട ഇപ്പോൾ ഒരു കൊല്ലം കഴിഞ്ഞിരിക്കുന്നു. ഞാൻതന്നെ പ്രജാസഭയിലും, നിയമസഭയിലും ദിവാൻജിയുടെ അടുക്കൽ മുഖാവിലും പൊതുജനങ്ങളുടെ ആരോഗ്യസ്ഥിതിയിലുള്ള സങ്കടങ്ങളെപ്പറ്റി പറഞ്ഞിട്ടുള്ളതിൽ യാതൊരു പ്രയോജനവും ഉണ്ടായിട്ടില്ല. എന്നാൽ ഈ ആണ്ടിൽ വിഷൂചിക ജനങ്ങളെബാധിച്ചപ്പോൾ പൊതുജനങ്ങളുടെ ആരോഗ്യരക്ഷ ഒരു പ്രധാനകായ്മാണെന്നു ഗവർണ്മെൻറു വിചാരിക്കയും, അതിനുവേണ്ടി എന്തെല്ലാം ചെയ്യാൻസാധിക്കുമോ അതൊക്കെ ഗവൺമെൻറ് ചെയ്കയും ചെയ്തു (മി: എം. ശിവതാണുപിള്ള ഹീയർ, ഹീയർ) ഇവിടത്തെ ഗവർണ്മെൻറു ജനങ്ങളുടെ ആരോഗ്യരക്ഷയിൽ പ്രത്യേകം താല്പര്യം കാണിച്ചിട്ടുള്ളതു, ഇപ്പോൾ മാത്രമേയുള്ളുഎന്നു പറയാൻ എനിക്കു തോന്നുന്നില്ല. അതിലേക്കു ഏതു നിലയിലാണ് ഗവൺമെൻറിനോട് നന്ദിപറയേണ്ടതെന്നറിയാതെ പൊതുജനങ്ങൾ വിഷമിക്കുന്നു. ദിവാൻജിയെ നേരിട്ടുകണ്ടു നന്ദിപറയണമെന്നു പലമാന്യന്മാരും എന്നോടു ആവശ്യപ്പെട്ടിട്ടുണ്ട്. അതിലേക്കു ഇതുവരെസാധിക്കാത്തതുകൊണ്ടു ഈ കൌൺസിലിൽവച്ചുപൊതുജനങ്ങളുടെ നന്ദിയെ ഞാൻ അറിയിച്ചുകൊള്ളുന്നു.

ഇംഗ്ലീഷ് ചികിത്സയിൽസാധുക്കൾക്കു ഇന്നത്തെഡാക്ടർമാരെക്കൊണ്ടു ചികിത്സിക്കാൻ വളരെ വിഷമമാണു. ഗ്രാൻഡ് ഇൻഎയിഡ് ആശുപത്രികളുടെ സ്ഥിതി അതിനേക്കാൾ കഷ്ടമാണ്. സാധുക്കൾക്കു മരുന്നുകിട്ടുകയില്ല അടുത്തകാലത്തുണ്ടായ ഒരു ദൃഷ്ടാന്തംപറയാം, ഒരു പ്രസവകേസിനു ഒരു ഡാക്ടരെ വിളിച്ചുകൊണ്ടുപോയി അരഫർലാങ്ങ്

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. T. Kumara Pillai.]

ദ്ദരെ എത്തിയപ്പോഠം സ്ത്രീ പ്രസവിച്ചു എന്നറിയിച്ചു. ശരിയായ ഫീസ് തരണമെന്ന ഡാക്ടർ നിർബന്ധിച്ചു അവരിൽനിന്നും വാങ്ങിച്ചു. ഇതി നെഎല്ലാം തടയുന്നതിന ഡാക്ടർ രാമൻതമ്പി വേണ്ടശ്രമം ചെയ്യുന്നുണ്ട്. എങ്കിലും ഇതുശരിയായികാണുന്നില്ല. ഇതിലേക്കുള്ള കാരണമെന്താ ണെന്ന് ഗവൺമെൻറുതന്നെ അന്വേഷിച്ചു കണ്ടുപിടിച്ചു വേണ്ടത് ചെയ്യേണ്ടതാണ്.

MR. N. K. KRISHNA PILLAI (*Neyyattinkara*): Sir, I rise to support the motion. My own impression is that the mover has made an exceptionally strong case. The mover has approached the question as a scientist. But I would offer a few words as a layman in support of the motion. At the very outset I might submit that I am at one with the views expressed by my friends Messrs. Kunjitomman and Joseph with regard to the usefulness of the system, and, as a layman, I submit a a plea for a system of medicine in which there is the least drugging. We are also told that one of the first merits of the Homeopathic system is its druglessness. From my own experience I see just now around me a number of small Homeopathic dispensaries established by private practitioners throughout our State. It is also a matter of common observation that even cultured classes resort to these Homeopathic practitioners in large numbers. My submission is, that it is due, in a large measure, also to the success of the Homeopathic treatment. But my submission is that if at all there is anything unattractive about the system, it is that the Government do not recognise it. To me it also seems that it is only well and good that we have side by side various systems of medical relief. I would also suggest that the Government should have various types of medical systems once they are proved useful. Of course, the Homeopathic system is as much foreign to us as the Allopathic system. If so, I ask why should the Government be partial to one system and disregard the other.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): May I know whether the member is of opinion that the Government always try to favour foreign systems?

MR. N. K. KRISHNA PILLAI (*Neyyattinkara*): Yes. Especially in view of the fact that the system is more effective, more popular and less injurious. The Government, we see, spend a large amount of money every year for Allopathic hospitals and grants are also made to Ayurvedic physicians. My submission is that it is high time that the Government give the same help and encouragement to Homeopathic practitioners also.

But there is one other consideration also, which seems to me to be important. The available medical aid is, I see, beyond the reach of the village. It is the townsmen that make the best of it because the hospitals are, almost all, situated within the towns; and hospitals we know are complex institutions which involve very great expenditure and therefore they cannot be planted wherever they are needed,

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Therefore my submission is that it is all the more necessary that we should have a simpler, cheaper and smaller institution like the Homeopathic dispensaries.

As for the objection taken by Mrs. Lukose with regard to that part of the resolution concerning duly qualified men, my submission is that there is no difficulty at all about it. Once a proposal is accepted, it is for the Government to fix any standard. The Government might themselves constitute a Board of Examiners as the examining body. We are also told, as a matter of fact, that there are reliable examining bodies in Calcutta and other places for Homeopathy. So my submission is that the objection taken is not quite sound. With these few words, I would heartily support the resolution.

MR. G. RAMAN MENON (*Mavelikara* cum *Kartikapalli*): Sir, I warmly support the resolution before the House. In considering some points in connection with the resolution I have some contributions to make. In the first place it was urged that the number of duly qualified Homepathic medical practitioners is small. It seems to me that this is an additional reason why the Government can very easily take action. If there are a large number of duly qualified medical practitioners belonging to this school, the Government might find some difficulty in choosing between them. Here there is not that difficulty.

Then it might be urged that the opinions of ordinary men who are not experts are not of much value in this connection. I beg to differ from that view. It was, I think, Dr. Johnson who once said that at forty every man is either a doctor or a fool. Many of us are over forty and we have had some scientific training. So we can more or less judge the result of the treatment given to us by different doctors and judge between them.

Another matter to be remembered in this connection is that the greatest advances in all branches of medicine as well as in other professions were made not by the so-called professional experts, but by men of large scientific training who were above professional prejudices. The large majority of all the professionalists in any age are conservative. Even in medical practice great advances were made by the help of eminent men of scientific outlook not by narrow experts,—so-called experts. They are really no experts. They are prejudiced conservative people who stand in the way of progress. That can be seen if we examine the history of medicine itself. I had much to say upon that subject but I am not quite prepared to quote the examples now. I hope that even medical gentlemen who are conversant with the history of medicine will acknowledge that the large majority of the professionalists in any age have stood in the way of progress. It was in spite of the opposition that the advances were made. The other day I quoted Dr. Osler, a very great expert, but a non-prejudiced expert, in the realm of Allopathic medicine, to show that the practice of drugging is dangerous and useless. In the case of Ayurvedic medicine also,

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. G. Raman Menon.]

recognition was given to it in Travancore as well as in other parts in spite of the opposition of the Allopathic doctors as was pointed out by Mr. Mammen Mappillai and others. If the Government were guided at that time by merely the so-called expert opinion of Allopathic doctors the Ayurvedic system would not have been encouraged. Even now there are many western medical men who condemn the Ayurvedic system of medicine as unscientific, dangerous and as killing people. On the other hand, there are eminent allopathic doctors who have said that Allopathy does injury to the people. The heavy drugging with poisonous and deleterious drugs practised by the generality of the practitioners of the Allopathic system of medicine, both European and Indian, has become not only a menace but a curse to the people of Travancore. The Indian system generally is a little less dangerous since its drugs are not generally so poisonous or deleterious to the people of this country as those of the European Allopathic system. This is so, because the physical system of our people has, by long use, to a certain extent, adjusted itself to the use of the drugs of the Indian system and because many of these drugs are herbs and roots which are not deleterious but salubrious in their effects. But in some of the Indian systems of Allopathy also there are many injurious drugs especially those of inorganic mineral origin which have caused very grave dangers in many cases, such as the preparations of mercury, arsenic, etc. Great scientists and medical men of world-wide recognition have condemned the use of large doses of drugs, especially of the deleterious drugs, as the result of the careful experiments made by them. Many of us have by bitter experience learnt at least something about the great dangers of drugging. The official medical member of this Council also acknowledged the other day the necessity for the Medical Department and the medical men to keep abreast of the times and the grave dangers that may arise by failure to do so.

As stated by my friend Mr. M. N. Pillai, both from the history of the movement and its present status in Europe and America, and his own practical experience, Homeopathy has long passed the experimental stage. It is a well-established system of relieving human sufferings and is largely in use among the most successful physicians of the world. Those who were once Allopaths have become Homeopaths. Under the special circumstances of India and Travancore it is not only highly desirable but necessary that the system of Homeopathy which is free from the dangers of drugging should be given fair recognition as soon as practicable. A beginning should be made at once. Give the people a chance to escape the dangers of the drugging system. It will be a good experiment if the Government establish Homeopathic hospitals under competent medical men of that school in a few centres where there are Allopathic hospitals and compare the results of the working of the two in the cure and relief of diseases. We should try a halt to the opening of new Allopathic hospitals and dispensaries of the European

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

system and see whether the people will not be benefited to a great extent by the opening of Homeopathic hospitals and dispensaries where there is a demand for new dispensaries.

This will also be of considerable financial advantage to the Government and the people. The infinitesimal medicines of the Homeopathic system are infinitely cheaper than the drugs of the European Allopathic system and this is a very great thing for a poor people like us. It is a foolish thing to go in for costly drugs which are deleterious to the human system when infinitely cheaper preparations which are free from all dangerous effects are available.

The most up-to-date system of treating human diseases is the system of natural therapeutics. Homeopathy has a place in the system. The use of some Allopathic medical preparations which are not poisonous or suppressive in their effects also has a place in the system. But Allopathy as such is based on principles which are the very opposite of those on which the system of natural therapeutics is based. On the other hand, Homeopathy is not only not inconsistant with the principles of natural therapeutics, but is based on a partial and early recognition of some of the main principles of modern natural therapeutics.

So, from a consideration of general policy also, the recognition and the encouragement of Homeopathy will be a step in the right direction towards the ultimate establishment of natural therapeutics, as the system of medicine recognised by the State. All other systems have a legitimate place in the modern and up-to-date system, which is largely prevalent in Germany, America, and the European countries generally. But, our people and our Government may find it difficult to establish such institutions in sufficient numbers for sometime to come, owing to the ignorance of our medical men and the people about the modern treatment of diseases based on the most recent discoveries in physiology biology, biological chemistry and other branches of science. We may not be able to get qualified men to run the institutions. So, I suggest that one or two institutions of the kind may also be opened under one or two of the most cultured and scientific doctors available in the country with the help of the excellent books on natural therapeutics which are published in America and which are available for sale in India also. As regards Homeopathy there is no dearth of qualified men. So the Government can at once proceed to establish Homeopathic hospitals and dispensaries on a fairly large scale in the country. Some of the Homeopathic doctors will also be found competent to utilise the principles and the methods of natural therapeutics. I also suggest that the Government should get down a sufficient number of copies of Dr. Lindlahr's works on natural therapeutics and supply one set of the volumes to each of the Government and aided medical institutions in the State, the heads of which know English and therefore may be expected to take advantage of the books. Homeopathic doctors will find it easier to adopt the new system than doctors of other systems. I am certain that all persons who have a scientific, turn of mind will be greatly impressed and benefited by a perusal of any

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. G. Raman Menon.]

of the recognised books on natural therapeutics. So, as a way for the ultimate establishment of a rational system of treating diseases also, I support the Homeopathic system and request that the resolution may be accepted.

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI (*Agastisvaram*): Sir, I have listened with very great interest to the speech delivered by Mr. M. N. Pillai in support of his resolution. It has been very instructive especially as to the efficacy of the system of treatment he himself is practising. From his argument, I have been enabled to understand that he himself has got very great confidence in the efficacy of his treatment and that is the secret of his success. Anyhow I am not in a position to say much about the Homeopathic form of treatment. But I know one thing; children always like medicines given by doctors following that system of treatment, and once they are acquainted with that medicine they cry for more medicine. Of course, that is argument enough that that form of treatment is likely to have a bright future. The present young children when they grow old are sure to give greater support to the system in future.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): May I know whether you support or oppose the resolution?

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI (*Agastisvaram*): I have already indicated at the outset my attitude towards the motion now under discussion. There was a time when Government thought it necessary to organise a medical department and also to establish hospitals and dispensaries in various parts of Travancore with two objects in view. One of them was to establish charitable institutions in different parts of the State and another was to popularise the Allopathic form of treatment in the State. But time has considerably changed and the people also have become changed with it and as such I think, help now-a days is not required. We have at present any number of young men, adventurous enough to go out in search of knowledge. Such men are coming in larger numbers and what we actually find is, that they are not able to get sufficient employment in the State.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): May I know whether it is his view, from the point of view of unemployment?

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI (*Agastisvaram*): The problem of unemployment has become more and more acute every day and I think it is high time that Government withdraw from the field little by little so as to afford employment for young men who come every year with additional knowledge from outside.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): What about the poor?

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI (*Agastisvaram*): I am coming to that. If the Government adopt that policy, that will be in itself an encouragement to that form of treatment for which our friend Mr. M. N. Pillai wants Government support.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI *(Commerce and Industry, South)*: May I know whether the problem of unemployment applies only to Homeopathic practitioners?

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI *(Agastisvaram)*: No. These institutions have long ceased to be charitable. So far as I know, it is the rich that get better treatment and better medicine from our medical institutions than the poor. If such rich men are not given free medicines in our Government medical institutions, I am sure that will be another form of encouragement to other systems of medicine. Sir, I know a number of systems of treatment and I cannot say a word against any one of them. There is the Unani system, Chintamani system, Cuni form of treatment, Naturapathic system etc. Each system has its own supporters. The resolution is only an attempt to place the thin end of the wedge. Other systems are likely to come in one after another for Government support and, of course, members of this House know when to hammer down the wedge when it is once fixed in position. Suppose half a dozen medical institutions crop up side by side in every nook and corner of the State. Unemployment problem will only be getting more serious day by day. To remedy that, it is time, the department should confine their attention more and more to the really poor and deserving and leave others to look after themselves. I am stating that with regard to the present Allopathic form of treatment alone. I am not in favour of Government giving support to all forms of medical treatment simply because our young men who are prepared to go out and get themselves educated are capable of standing on their own legs. They must be given sufficient field to work.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI *(Ambalapuzha)*: Will the member explain the relation between unemployment and hospitals?

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI *(Agastisvaram)*: I have already answered that in the earlier portion of my speech.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI *(Commerce and Industry, South)*: May I know whether it is for giving more employment to the present people who are suffering from unemployment that he advocates this?

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI *(Agastisvaram)*: I am for giving more employment to private practitioners. I am against Government giving further undertaking with regard to medical aid.

As regards grant-in-aid I may say that a large number of private hospitals receive support from the Government and the system itself has become sufficiently popularised, so much so that Government need not do any further propaganda work in that direction.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR *(Shertallai)*: How does the member propose to give additional employment to private practitioners by opposing this resolution.

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI *(Agastisvaram)*: This resolution wants the Government to establish more dispensaries and hospitals.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI *(Commerce and Industry, South)*: Where is the harm for the Government in accepting the resolution?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI (*Agastisvaram*): There are half a dozen systems of treatment and deserving cases may be taken into consideration.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): If Government recognise the Homeopathic system will not more people be coming in for this sort of treatment and consequently more practitioners will come in the field.

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI (*Agastisvaram*): I am for leaving the Government alone.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Is the member in favour of discontinuance of the existing hospitals?

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI (*Agastisvaram*): I am in favour of gradual withdrawal of the Government from their work of giving medical aid.

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Does not Mr. Subrahmanya Pillai see that if the resolution is accepted, there will be necessity for appointing a Director to supervise these institutions?

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI (*Agastisvaram*): Certainly. Not only that; other systems will come forward for the support of Government and that means the creation of more departments?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Is there any difficulty to find out men? Suppose, the Government were to send students to Europe and America, to qualify in Homeopathy, do you think there will be any difficulty in getting a qualified doctor to supervise the institutions.

MR. M. SUBRAHMANYA PILLAI (*Agastisvaram*): I am not at all in favour of the Government giving any help in this direction by supporting new systems. On the other hand they must gradually withdraw their activities in the matter of giving medical aid.

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): I am very reluctant to talk upon the resolution at this stage. I only want to show one aspect of the matter in answer to the issue before the House. Mr. M. N. Pillai says there will be no difficulty whatever in getting the service of qualified men to superintend the work of Homeopathic doctors. What I say is, we have been treading in the wrong direction by distributing state patronage to all kinds of doctors. It is high time that the Government withdraw gradually the help that is now rendered. Doctors are multiplying to an enormous extent so that they are becoming a menace to the society. Too many cooks spoil the dish, so also, so many doctors spoil the life of many people.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Is it the opinion of the member that there are too many doctors in Travancore to-day?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Yes.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): May I know the source of the information?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): My own opinion.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I may inform the member that he is entirely in the wrong.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): May I know whether the member heard what Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai said ?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Yes

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertalai*): May I know whether my friend has any comparative idea of the medical men in England and in Travancore ?

MR. A. K PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): I have not. I am not comparing one system with another. I only say that this policy of spending more and more money upon system after system of medical treatment, should be discontinued. It is high time that these systems are left alone so that they might struggle among themselves and we may have the advantage of the fittest that survives. There is no point in recognising Allopathy and spending large sums of money upon it and then doing the same thing with regard to Homeopathy and then with Aayurveda and then with Chintamani and so on. Then somebody else may come and say that there are people who believe in mantravadams as a system of treatment and he may say that the State money should be spent to encourage mantravadams too.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): If there are people who require mantravadams to cure them, should not mantravadam be resorted to ?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Every man has got a right even to commit suicide (cries of no, no). My point is let not Government encourage one system or another. Let not Government say we are going to patronise this system or that. It is high time that the Government leave all these systems alone.

MR. T. J. MATTHEW (*Changanachery* cum *Peermade*): Has any person the right to kill another ?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): It is exactly that. No man has a right to kill another. If a man takes a wrong course let us stop him. We are every day allowing black magic to be performed in the name of medicine and in the names of great persons who have sacrificed their everything for the sake of medicine.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Is it not therefore necessary in the interest of humanity to prevent such things ?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Yes. The official member had the grace to accept that. Dr. Hahnemann did great service in performing experiments and in teaching the lesson that we should not use too much of drugs. It was he who turned us in the right direction and pointed out that the practice of using too much of drugs was bad. If I accept the views of Dr. Hahnemann and let myself to be guided by that, I will come to the conclusion which will be entirely different from that drawn by my friend Mr. M. N. Pillai. My conclusion will be this. Let us reduce this

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. A. K. Pillai.]

drug gradually and let us come to the stage of civilisation when we have people existing freely and peacefully without any embarrassment from doctors. Instead of that, the resolution of Mr. M. N. Pillai seeks to have new doctors, to have a new system recognised, to be patronised and all that.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I know whether the member is aware that animals live without drugs and that it is therefore a privilege to use drugs just to distinguish a man from an animal?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): I do not consider that as a point of superiority of man over animals to be treated by another human being. I would consider that as a mark of barbarity if we want to be surrounded by the constable on the one side and the doctor on the other. We must have the freedom and good sense and education to support ourselves, to be our own doctors. That is not what we do at present.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Can we not do that, without our caps on? (*Laughter*).

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): According to me the Government must maintain, so far as the medical department is concerned, efficient and first class research institutes to find out remedies for such diseases like that of the hookworm.

MR K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Is it not costly?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): It is not by keeping a doctor here and a doctor there—

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): കാലക്രമം കൊണ്ടു് ആശുപത്രികൾ മുഴുവനും ഇല്ലാതെ ആക്കണമെന്നാണല്ലോ മി. എ. കെ. പിള്ളയുടെ അഭിപ്രായം. പിന്നെ റിസർച്ചിനുവേണ്ടി പണം കളയേണ്ട ആവശ്യമുണ്ടോ?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): That will be possible only when we do medical research. It is only then that we can come to that position. What I am saying is this. Let us not create new obstacles in the way, let us not create new vested interests, let us not create another vested interest in the name of Homeopathy.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): ഗവണ്മെന്റും ജനങ്ങളും ആ നിലയിൽ എത്തുന്നകാലംവരെ നമുക്കു ആശുപത്രികൾ നിലനിർത്തിക്കൊണ്ടു പോകാതിരിക്കാൻ തരമുണ്ടോ?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): We are progressing like that and let us hope so.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Kalkulam* cum *Vilavankod*): അങ്ങിനെ എത്തിയതിന്റെശേഷം ഗവണ്മെന്റു് മി. എ. കെ പിള്ളയുടെ അഭിപ്രായം സ്വീകരിക്കുകയും അതനുസരിച്ചു പ്രവർത്തിക്കുകയും അല്ലേ വേണ്ടതു്?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*) : I may just draw the attention of my friend Mr. Kumara Pillai to the fact that we are not going to have one fine morning when we shall say that everything is perfect. Let us deliberately plan the future when we shall have no necessity for the doctor. I take this as the opportunity to take the first step in that direction. This is the time when we are asked to vote a premium upon ill health, to vote for doctors who want to thrive on ill health. We have had sufficient trouble with Allopathy. Let us not make more experiments with other systems. When we are called upon to make experiments upon medicine we are called upon to make experiments upon the life of the poor.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : What has the member to say in regard to the Kuni system ?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*) : So following the experiment of Dr. Hahnemann of revered memory what I say is this. The natural conclusion of his researches is that naturapathy is the best system. But I am not going to seek the aid of Government to popularise naturapathy. I am confident that naturapathy on account of its intrinsic merit can stand on itself. Here Dr. M. N. Pillai comes forward saying that Dr. Hahnemann has been so popular and that therefore his system must be given some aid. Are they not doing something which they ought not to do ? They have been able to thrive very well even according to Dr. M. N. Pillai till now without Government help. Why then do they require Government aid *now* ?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*) : May I know whether the member has said anything in this connection when he had sent cut motion of the Medical Department at the last Budget Session ?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*) : I think I made it definite that the State must recede gradually from the present position and should not continue to give such patronage.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*) : At the time of that discussion was he not encouraging Allopathy ?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*) : I did not. I raised my protest. My point was and even now is, let us gradually follow a course of withdrawal of Government patronage, until we come to a stage when the people can live peacefully without the help of the doctor. Now Mr. M. N. Pillai comes and says " You are encouraging Allopathy ; why not this ? ". I am against this, not because I consider Homeopathy or any other system inferior or superior but for the simple reason that no particular system should be encouraged. Now Mr. Piraviperumal Pillai said that there is a demand for Homeopathy. It is an astounding proposition to say that there is a demand for a particular system of medicine. The demand is always for a cure and not for a particular system.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*) : May I know whether anybody will prefer surgical operation to the administration of medicine if the latter will readily effect a cure ?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): I can concede all that. I can also concede that children are benefited by the system. All that I say is, that a larger view of the question should be taken. If it is beneficial it should supplement the existing system. It should not be run on independent lines along with the present system. If it is very advantageous we may ask for a new section, in the General Hospital, being opened for that. If the case is for more medical aid and for increasingly larger expansion of means of medical relief, then certainly I can agree with such a view. I can then understand the demand. But here they are asking for independent existence, for a new recognition. That appears to my mind to be very dangerous to the future. So, my anxious prayer is that the House must keep awake and see that we are now going in the wrong direction. Supposing this resolution is accepted, then the necessary consequence will be that we shall have to concede the necessity for new departments just like the Departments of Ayurveda and Allopathy. Are we prepared for that? Let us be conscious of the subject that we are talking.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): If it is found after the creation of a department of Homeopathy that the expenditure on the department of Allopathy is minimised, where is the objection to the starting of such a department?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): If it can exist on its own merits why should the Government give any aid? Why should the Government extend any help? It can thrive very well even without Government aid. Let us suppose that in accepting Homeopathy as a good system of medicine we are going in the right direction. Even then, we do not want superfluous help from the Government or from anybody when we are able to stand on our own legs. It is only the weak that need extraneous support.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): Is it the people's wish—

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Medical relief can be afforded in ever so many forms.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): Sir, I have not yet finished my question.

Does the member know that the Government have all these departments for the people?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): The resolution, as I understand it, is not for extending aid to the people; but only for extending to Homeopathic doctors also the help that is now rendered to Allopathic doctors.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Does not the resolution speak of the expansion of medical aid also?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): The subject-matter of the resolution is in regard to the Homeopathic doctors and not the people.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Does it not behove a good Government to give monitary help to all systems at the initial stage?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Dr. M. N. Pillai does not say that it is at its initial stage. He says that it is very popular even now.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): Is not the Government by the people for the people?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): As I have already stated, my point is that the House should take a larger view of the question. If they do so the resolution will not at all commend itself to them. I do not want to press that point further. Because personally I feel that this system is less harmful than other systems of treatment. But that is not the argument why the Government should encourage it. If it is harmless and even good, let the people take to it.

MR. N. K. KRISHNA PILLAI (*Neyyattinkara*): Does it not follow from the member's argument that Allopathy and Ayurveda also do not require Government help?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): That is exactly my position. But I do not demand it just now, the withdrawal of the Government help now given to Allopathy and Ayurveda. But the policy of the Government should be the gradual withdrawal of this superfluous help now being rendered to Allopathy and Ayurveda.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): Is it necessary, according to the member, that there should be a Dr. Kunjan Pillai to encourage scientific cultivation?

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): The State has responsibility towards the people in regard to three things. Firstly, it is the education of the people so that they may be able to judge for themselves and they may be able to live a sanitary life beyond the need for medical aid. If I am to accept the opinions of my learned friends Mr. P. K. Narayana Pillai and Mr. Kumara Pillai, they only condemn the present system of treatment. I ask, what right have they, who condemn the present system, to demand that more help should be given by the Government. Are they not, I say, moving in a vicious circle? Their case is that our Allopathic doctors have been spoiled by the patronage distributed by Government. Now, they want to help and therefore to spoil the Homeopathic doctors also. I say, "Stop with Allopathy; and even there gradually withdraw your help. Let Homeopathy thrive by its own worth". I have only to say, in conclusion that the Government must be very cautious in taking this step. And the House also must be aware of all that this step involves.

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): Sir, Dr. M. N. Pillai has come to this House with an appeal (*Louder, please*) for a liberal system of grants in aid to Homeopathic institutions. We can quite understand why Dr. M. N. Pillai, who has been himself a practitioner for a large number of years, wishes to come to this House with a proposal of this kind. I do not wish to criticise Homeopathy as a system—

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): May I know whether he is talking on behalf of Government or on his own behalf?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): The member can ask me questions after hearing me in full.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): Usually members on the first row of the official benches speak on behalf of the Government. I want to know whether the Financial Secretary is now speaking on his own behalf or on behalf of the Government.

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): I have not spoken anything, Sir, so far. I have not expressed any opinion so far. The member is making an assumption, Sir. I merely wish to sound a note of caution to this House. The resolution that we are now asked to commit ourselves to is

"This Council recommends to the Government that they be pleased to encourage Homeopathy by a liberal system of grants in aid to duly qualified practitioners of the system in Travancore and by opening Homeopathic dispensaries and hospitals in places where there is a great demand for them".

Now, Sir, there is a great deal of difficulty about this, 'duly qualified medical practitioners'. Dr. M. N. Pillai himself was asked by another member as to whether he could mention the names of some eminent practitioners of that system in Travancore. He did not wish to answer; and when pressed, the question took a personal turn and he did not wish to say that he knew at least one person, namely himself. I do not mean any disparagement at all. But it shows to the House the great difficulty the Government will have to face in finding out a standard of qualification on which to base the system of grants, if they go in for such grants at all.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I can give the names of about a dozen men who have got qualifications from the Calcutta College.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): What is the harm in accepting the principle of giving liberal grants-in-aid if there are duly qualified persons?

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): The principle of the resolution is to give a system of grants-in-aid on a liberal scale and to establish hospitals and dispensaries. Certainly, before we are assured that there are eminently qualified men in sufficient numbers who, tested by ordinary scientific standards, could be entrusted with this work, I do not think the Government can accept the principle of the resolution. I believe it means some money.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): May I know whether the Government cannot accept the principle of the resolution that grants in aid would be given *if duly qualified persons are available*?

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): I am sure the member does not expect me to answer the question.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Does the member say that there is not even a single duly qualified man?

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): I do not say so.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): Then why not accept the principle of the resolution?

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): It is a matter which means some money.

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): If the Government find duly qualified men, then alone need they give any encouragement.

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): It is very easy to put the thin end of the wedge. I only want now to sound a note of caution?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): What is that note of caution?

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): You can ask me questions, if you like, after I finish my speech. Some of the members who supported the resolution were carried by the criticisms levelled by

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): May I know whether the member would be satisfied—

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): May I speak five minutes, and then I shall answer questions. I shall be very pleased to answer questions after five minutes.

Sir, some of the members were carried away, or at least appeared to be carried away, by the criticisms levelled against the department. It is very easy to give one instance of an unqualified doctor being put in charge of a dispensary which receives a grant in aid. The Government member has stated that it could not be so. But, even admitting that it is a fact, I say, it will not be fair to be carried away by a few stray instances like that and, not only to condemn the department but, to go in for a different and new system altogether which naturally involves a large sum of money. We should all see that when we spend money we get the best value for our money.

Another point that seems to carry away the members is the feeling that Homeopathy, the moment it is encouraged, would mean economy of expenditure on the part of Government in regard to medical aid. It may be possible, Sir, so far as the medicines themselves are concerned, because of the very small quantity of drugs that Homeopathic doctors use. Dr. M. N. Pillai circulated for the benefit of the members a pamphlet wherein there was an illustration given of the buildings that might be necessary and the number and nature of the beds that might be necessary. If I remember correctly, I suppose there must be 736 beds in a building of about 20 stories.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): The whole thing will cost about 65 lakhs of rupees.

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): I merely wish to say that we should not be carried away by the idea that because the Homeopathic doctors use drugs only in small quantities, we shall be economising by adopting that system. Some members

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. K. N. Ramasubba Aiyar.]

pertinently asked whether we were going to stop some of the existing hospitals and replace them by Homeopathic institutions. I believe even the mover of the resolution does not go so far as that. I merely say that we should not go in for a definite item of expenditure without being assured that it is really necessary or whether we get all the advantages that we should get for the money that we propose to spend. The resolution is not merely for instituting an enquiry to find out what could be done in the matter. It is not for 10 or 12 doctors. Mr. M. N. Pillai expects, as soon as the Government announces their intention of recognising the Homeopathic system and of giving liberal grants-in-aid to duly qualified practitioners, hundreds of qualified men from Calcutta to come here and ask for grants from the Government. If the Government had been given any idea as to the number of duly qualified practitioners then probably it would have been easier for them to consider the question. Without any such data if the House ask the Government to incur a definite liability, and a recurring liability, I think I should sound a note of caution to this House before it supports such a large demand.

Any questions, Sir?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): May I know whether he is aware that there are medical men in the department now who have absolutely no qualification from any Government institution?

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): I can answer that question by putting a counter question. What is the percentage of such men?

MR. K. I. JOSEPH (*Minachil* cum *Devicolam*): I rise to a point of order, Sir. Can one question be answered by a counter question?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): The member ought to know the percentage. There are several men in the department who have been trained only in private institutions in Calcutta.

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): The *Civil List* gives the qualifications of all the medical men of the department. The House can draw its conclusion from that.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Sir, I had no idea of making a speech by way of supporting this resolution. But from the very vehement way in which this innocent resolution has been attacked by some members on this side and by some on the other side, I feel that I should raise my little finger in support of this resolution. Although I cannot speak with authority on this subject, yet from what little experience I have had with this system of treatment I should say that this system is becoming more and more popular with the people. It is found to be very effective especially in curing certain types of diseases, especially so it is the case in the treatment of children. Children, as somebody else suggested, run to the father for Homeopathic medicines, whereas it is very difficult to make them take in Allopathic or Ayurvedic medicines. As we all know, any slight change in the weather affects the delicate health of children and they get slight fever or headache. The

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

child, in such cases, at once runs to the father of its own accord for Homeopathic medicines. It says 'Papa, I am suffering from fever. Give me pills.' That is the way in which little children ask for this medicine. The pills are very effective and at once the child becomes as smart as he was before the attack of fever. There is this specific relief in the case of Homeopathy. That itself is sufficient reason, as Mr. Piraviperumal Pillai pointed out, why this system has got to be supported.

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): Does the member seek to convey that the fever will not come down if treated in any other system ?

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): But then it is very difficult to make the patients take in the Allopathic or the Ayurvedic medicines.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): The fever will increase since the other medicines are not palatable.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): The point is this. Children very easily, even of their own accord, take in these very effective Homeopathic medicines. They are sweet.

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): I thought they were tasteless, Sir.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Another point is that it affords relief to the poor. It is very cheap. For these reasons Homeopathy has got to be encouraged. As Mr. M. N. Pillai suggested, it is not so much for the pecuniary aid that he wants this resolution to be accepted. He simply wants the Government to recognise these advantages of this system. He wants this recognition at the hands of the Government.

On account of lack of recognition the poor people have got so much to run about for these dispensaries. On the other hand, if the Government recognise a system by way of giving some grants, it need not necessarily be liberal but small, certainly it will be a great help to those who are in the rural areas. It is not easy for the people in rural parts to run into hospitals and get medical aid and whereas if these dispensaries are started it will give them great relief. Then, why not help and encourage them ? I find my friends supporting the resolution on that ground while others opposing it, as it is a jumble of inconsistencies. A Government member who is cautious over the accounts of the State, has been sounding a note of warning, what exactly he ought to do. But if the system is approved why not you set about ?

Mr. A K. Pillai has been objecting to the resolution from the point of view of economy and also from the point of view that another department will be created.

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Is there any objection in opening a Children's Section in hospitals and dispensaries where Homeopathic medicines may be administered ?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): It does not in any way add to the economy of the department.

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): Is not a large amount of money required for opening new hospitals?

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): New hospital means, not in the way of very big hospitals. But only poor houses and only some buildings are required.

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): Does the member want very small buildings or buildings as the mover of the resolution suggests?

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Building on a small scale as in the case of Ayurvedic Hospitals to start with, and for that not more than Rs. 500 is required. If that could be done for 500 rupees poor houses could be had for Rs. 300 or so. For these reasons I support the resolution.

MR. KURANDIPALLIL R. RAMAN PILLAI (*Quilon*): I move the question be now put.

MR. T. J. MATTHEW (*Changanacherry* cum *Peermade*): I second it.

The motion was put and carried.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Sir, I am not surprised with the reply of Mrs. Lukose regarding my resolution. There is the inherent hatred of Allopathic doctors towards Homeopathy from the very beginning. Dr. Hahnemann, the founder of Homeopathy was himself a highly qualified M. D. of Leipzig University. When he established Homeopathy he was persecuted by Allopaths and he was driven from place to place till at last he settled down in Paris. Even now there is, to some extent, hatred towards Dr. Hahnemann and Homeopathy on the part of the Allopaths. I am not at all surprised at that. If these Allopathic doctors were to study Homeopathy also for the sake of the suffering humanity, and practise; 99 per cent of them would only practise Homeopathy. I find from my own experience that Allopathic doctors who were bitter enemies of Homeopathy have embraced Homeopathy and adhered to Homeopathic practice alone. I can quote the opinion of several doctors. Dr. Huffeland who was the Court physician of Germany says:

"I had the opportunity of observing many instances from the use of Homeopathic remedies."

Professor Bischoff says:

"Hahnemann has won for himself a most honourable name in the field of medicine."

Dr. Cross says:

"I cannot refrain from admiring Hahnemann's profound thoughtfulness and originality."

Professor Marchal De Cali says:

"All our knowledge in this point we owe to the world of the Homeopathists."

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): What does Dr. Hutchinson say?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Yesterday was the anniversary celebration of Dr. Hahnemann at the Homeopathic free dispensary at Madras and Major General Hutchinson, Surgeon General, presided over that meeting.

MR. M. SIVATANU PILLAI (*Tovala*): May I tell the member that the point is not that the system is not advanced but there is the dearth of practitioners in Travancore?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I shall point out that there is no dearth of practitioners in Travancore. Mrs. Lukose said of my speech that it is only fit to be delivered to school-boys.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I did not say that, Sir, I did not say that it was fit for only school-boys. I said that it would have been a very interesting speech, if it were delivered at the opening session of a School of Homeopathy.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I wish to say that my duty was to explain as far as possible the scientific aspect of Homeopathy and I wanted to impress on the members of this House the superiority of the system over others. The most important objection on the other side is about the dearth of qualified practitioners. I said in the beginning that it is not with any selfish motive that I brought this resolution. It is a well-known fact that Homeopathy has been doing immense good to all people and that there is a demand for it, and nobody can deny including Mrs. Lukose, that Homeopathy is doing good. I know many Allopathic doctors take to Homeopathy to treat children. I believe even Mrs. Lukose might have done so.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I have not done so far.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): It is not a disgrace to Allopaths if they do so. It is harmless, and less poison is introduced into the body of the patient. We find many Allopathic doctors with European qualifications practising the system. Recently in Madras half a dozen M. B., CH. B'.S, L. R. C. P. & S., and other Allopathic Doctors who have qualified themselves in Europe have resorted to Homeopathy.

MR. K. N. RAMASUBBA AIYAR (*Financial Secretary to Government*): Have we any in Trivandrum?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): When there is demand there will be several.

As regards qualified practitioners, there is one College at Calcutta where Homeopathy is taught on scientific lines. If you are not going to accept the Degree conferred there because it is not recognised—

MR. A. K. PILLAI (*Karunagapalli*): May I tell the member that there is a College at Mavelikara?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): There are so many like that. I know that several such institutions will come into being if there is sufficient encouragement in the country for Homeopaths. The thing is I do not request the Government to come forward and to start

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

them. Let them depute some of the medical men in their own service to America to study the system and to open a Department of their own. If there is any difficulty to find qualified men here and if they are doubtful about the efficacy of the treatment, let them set apart a ward in the General Hospital and see whether cases can not be treated and cured successfully according to Homeopathic system. Then I think these things can be easily understood and solved and there will be no difficulty to get qualified men.

MR. S. PIRAVIPERUMAL PILLAI (*Commerce and Industry, South*): As Mr. Subrahmanya Pillai pointed out is there any solution for unemployment?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I thank all the non-official members for having heartily supported the resolution. With these words I commend my resolution to the vote of the House.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I have got very little to add to what I have said already. I would like to remove a wrong impression created in the minds of some of the members by my reference to Mr. M. N. Pillai's speech. I meant no disparagement whatever. I explained before that my point was that Mr. M. N. Pillai had not made out a case for this House to support the resolution as he has not stated facts and figures regarding Homeopathy as it is practised in Travancore we hear a great deal of what Homeopathy has done in other parts of the world. Most of the members who spoke on the resolution said that Homeopathy is convenient and cheap and useful in the treatment of children. It is no doubt cheap and convenient but these considerations alone should not be taken into account. I am not convinced that it is as efficacious a system as Allopathy. It has its limitations as Mr. M. N. Pillai knows very well. This resolution has led to a general condemnation of the medical men in the department which was hardly necessary. We are used to that often in this House and I do not wish to say anything on that as the matter is not relevant nor is it necessary.

I would like to know whether any Government in India has recognised Homeopathy. I know it has been done in America and, so far as Europe is concerned, in Germany and Austria. But member after member—

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): In Germany, England and Sweden and other places.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I do not know what kind of recognition is given in these countries.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): In India the Kolhapur State has got a Homeopathic medical department.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*): I am glad to know that.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): The Madras Corporation gives a grant to Hahnemann Free Dispensary there and they cannot disburse that money without Government sanction.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*) : Any how, I am not sufficiently convinced that Homeopathy as it is practised in Travancore deserves any recognition as Mr. M. N. Pillai desires. I still oppose the resolution.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*): Is the member aware that there are a large number of unqualified Homeopathic doctors floating in the country treating cases and extracting money from the people ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Senior Surgeon, Women's Medical Service*) : The Police Commissioner would be the proper authority to answer that question.

MR. K. SIVARAMA PANIKKAR (*Shertallai*) : My question was whether the *member* is aware ?

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I press the motion.

The resolution was put to the vote and declared carried, 27 voting *for* and 17 *against*.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*) : I demand a poll.

PRESIDENT : It is too late now.

This Council will now terminate and its dissolution will be notified in the *Gazette* almost immediately. We have been here together for three years and I think the Council can claim to have done a fair amount of useful work. You have conducted that work in a business-like way. I hope all of you seek re-election and I hope to be able to see most of you here again for the next Council that is coming into being. It is always good to have to meet familiar faces and fall in together to work. I wish you all good fortune in the next election and re-entry in the Council.

The Council was prorogued at 4-25 P. M.

P. N. KRISHNA PILLAI,
Secretary to the Legislative Council.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly